

## Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	<b>Asian Journal of Case Reports in Surgery</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_AJCRS_92177</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Gastrointestinal Stromal Tumors of Neurofibromatosis Type I : a case report</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Case study</b>

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lac k of N o velt y**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajcrs.com/index.php/AJCRS/editorial-policy> )

**Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)																											
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>1. The manuscript needs extensive scientific and language editing.</b></p> <p><b>2. The diagnosis of the case as GIST can't be confirmed from the presented data and the performed IHC panel.</b></p> <p><b>To diagnose GIST,</b></p> <p><b>Positive stains should be:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>DOG1, 98%</b> (Am J Pathol 2004;165:107)</li> <li>• <b>c-KIT / CD117 with membranous, diffuse cytoplasmic or concentrated in a dot-like perinuclear pattern 95%</b> (Am J Surg Pathol 2009;33:1401)</li> <li>• <b>CD34 82%</b> (Am J Surg Pathol 2005;29:52) <b>versus 40% in small intestinal GIST</b> (Am J Surg Pathol 2006;30:477)</li> </ul> <p><b>Negative stains should be:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>S100</b> (to exclude schwannoma)</li> <li>• <b>BCL2 and STAT6</b> (to exclude Solitary fibrous tumor)</li> <li>• <b>Desmin and h. caldesmon</b> (to exclude leiomyoma)</li> </ul> <p><b>3. The microscopic image (Figure 5), doesn't show any positivity for c- KIT / CD117. It is clearly negative.</b></p> <p><b>4. Classification of the mass as "Malignant GIST" is incorrect on scientific basis:</b></p> <p><b>GIST is classified according to Risk of Disease Progression (Semin Diagn Pathol 2006;23:70) based on the following criteria:</b></p> <table border="1" data-bbox="727 1234 1537 1501"> <thead> <tr> <th>Size</th> <th>≤ 5 mitoses per 50 HPF</th> <th>&gt; 5 mitoses per 50 HPF</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>&gt; 10 cm</td> <td>Moderate</td> <td>High</td> </tr> <tr> <td>&gt; 5 to ≤ 10 cm</td> <td>Low</td> <td>High</td> </tr> <tr> <td>&gt; 2 to ≤ 5 cm</td> <td>Very low</td> <td>Moderate</td> </tr> <tr> <td>≤ 2 cm</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p><b>5. The histopathological differential diagnosis of the lesion should be discussed in detail.</b></p> <table border="1" data-bbox="884 1507 1635 1799"> <tbody> <tr><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> <tr><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr> </tbody> </table>	Size	≤ 5 mitoses per 50 HPF	> 5 mitoses per 50 HPF	> 10 cm	Moderate	High	> 5 to ≤ 10 cm	Low	High	> 2 to ≤ 5 cm	Very low	Moderate	≤ 2 cm	No	No													
Size	≤ 5 mitoses per 50 HPF	> 5 mitoses per 50 HPF																											
> 10 cm	Moderate	High																											
> 5 to ≤ 10 cm	Low	High																											
> 2 to ≤ 5 cm	Very low	Moderate																											
≤ 2 cm	No	No																											

**Review Form 1.6**

<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	<b>Revise the formatting of the references list. Many mistakes and missing citing information are noted.</b>	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Amal Abd El Hafez</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Mansoura University, Egypt</b>