

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Case Reports in Surgery
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJCRS_101857
Title of the Manuscript:	Adolescent Extra-Renal Wilms' Tumour : The Challenge Of Diagnosing Retroperitoneal Tumour Manifesting Hepatomegaly Symptoms In District Hospital.
Type of the Article	CASE REPORT

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajcrs.com/index.php/AJCRS/editorial-policy>)

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>1. The report is of interest.</p> <p>2. The title is suitable.</p> <p>3. The abstract should include overall stage at diagnosis (metastatic disease?) The abstract should also include outcome of the patient.</p> <p>4. The structure is okay.</p> <p>5. The manuscript needs improvement by giving the overall stage at diagnosis and also the local stage after surgery. It is also of interest to know the reason why the lung was initially irradiated. Was it because of initial lung metastasis, or was it prophylactically.</p> <p>6. No. See discussion.</p>	
<p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	No, English must be improved by a native speaker. There are many grammatical and spelling errors.	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>	<p>Case Report: It would be of interest to know about the overall stage at diagnosis, the local stage after surgery, the reason why the lungs were irradiated at initial treatment, and what the outcome after relapse was with lung metastasis was.</p> <p>Discussion: This needs to be improved. Typically, the symptoms is a painless swelling of the tumor and not a painful one. The oldest patient reported with Wilms tumor was over 60 years of age. See: J Clin Oncol 22:4500-4506; 2004: DOI: 10.1200/JCO.2004.12.099. In nephroblastoma trucut biopsy is important in difficult cases and also recommended, as it is useful. The only problem is missing of anaplasia. If diagnosis of Wilms tumor is confirmed by histology, then preoperative chemotherapy is also an option to downstage the tumor and it is not always necessary to perform an urgent primary surgery. There is a difference in treatment between COG in North America and SIOP outside of North America. The following paper should be discussed as well: https://doi.org/10.3390/cancers15092563. It is a case-based systematic literature review on pediatric extrarenal Wilms tumor, retrieving 72 papers with information on the diagnosis, treatment, and outcomes of 98 patients.</p>	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Review Form 1.7

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Norbert Graf
Department, University & Country	Saarland University, Germany