

Review Form 1.7

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name: | Asian Hematology Research Journal |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_AHRJ_101035 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Characteristics of Cytopenia in HIV Positive Individuals |
| Type of the Article | |

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalahrj.com/index.php/AHRJ/editorial-policy>)

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|--|---|
| <p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p> | <p>➤ Abstract Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>General comments</p> <p>➤ The abstract is not coherent</p> <p>➤ The authors did not put much effort into the preparation of the articles.</p> <p>➤ The author (s), did not follow the journal the requirements as concerns the use of abbreviations in the first instant eg “<i>HIV infection is an emerging</i>” <u>write HIV in full</u> then (<i>HIV</i>) I thereafter refer to it as <i>HIV</i>.</p> <p>➤ <i>This sense is unclear</i> “<u>Around 9500 infected individuals were in 2014 and it was only 500 individuals in 2000</u>”</p> <p>➤ The article has poor grammar, poor sentence construction, and many grammatical errors. I suggest the author(s) check spelling and grammar.</p> <p>➤ What message does the author (s) want to communicate to the scientific readership?</p> <p>➤ Unclear communication for example</p> <p>➤ Haematological manifestations are very common among those individuals- <u>which individuals? Please use scientific expressions that make the document flow without the reader filling in the gaps</u></p> <p>➤ “Haematological manifestations are very common among those individuals <i>whereas</i> cytopenia is the commonest”. The use of the word <u>Whereas</u> in this case is not correct.</p> <p>➤ The author(s) do not seem to understand the meaning of the phrase <i>Haematological manifestations</i>” otherwise they would not have used the phrase <u>“Whereas cytopenia is the commonest”</u>.</p> <p>➤ <u>HIV infection is an emerging-</u> I do not think that HIV infection is a newly emerging disease.</p> <p>➤ Objective: The authors have not mentioned findings on the specific objectives in the abstract</p> <p>➤ To assess the demographic status of the participants.</p> <p>➤ To assess the cytopenia with different variables.</p> <p>➤ To evaluate the proportion of cytopenia at baseline and 6, 12, and 24 months after HAART</p> <p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>➤ Methods :</p> <p>a. What was the gender and age profile of the participants as the two variables are confounding factors?</p> <p>b. Incomplete sentence: “<i>CD4 count measured by flow cytometry. Multiple</i>”</p> <p>c. Please make short complete readable sentences easy readership <i>break the sentence into three parts for example “:</i></p> <p>d. <u>The study was conducted in the Department of Haematology, Bangabandhu Sheikh Mujib Medical University (BSMMU).</u></p> <p>e. <u>It was in collaboration with the Dhaka, Bangladesh Ashar Alo Society, and the renowned Dhaka, Non- governmental organisation (NGO).</u></p> <p>f. <u>The study was conducted between January 2014 to December 2015”</u></p> <p>2 INTRODUCTION Spelling mistake</p> <p>g. <u>Mechanism</u> of this complication</p> <p>h. The others need to give a review of what else might bring about cytopenia</p> <p>3 METHODOLOGY</p> <p>➤ Study location and design</p> <p>➤ What influenced the authors to conduct the research at the university?</p> | |

Review Form 1.7

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ It is not clear whether the study was prospective or it was in retrospect ➤ Sampling /sample size / confounding factors: ➤ What do the authors mean when they state that the study was in collaboration with an NGO? ➤ how did the authors calculate the sample size of 100? ➤ How many of the participants were male and how many were female? ➤ How many of the female participants were of childbearing age which may have influenced the anaemia being the commonest form of cytopenia? ➤ How many of the participants were on ARVs which could have influenced the characteristics of cytopenia? ➤ Why did the authors, not report on the nutritional status of individuals on HAART? ➤ Nutrition is a confounding factor in individuals living with HIV and HAART documented to be highly prevalent amongst such individuals as weight loss and undernutrition is reported. ➤ What were the inclusion/ exclusion criteria? <p>4 RESULTS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Poor grammar In this study, among total 100 participants, 54% were male whereas the rest 46% were female. So male participants were dominating in number. Poor sentence construction <p>Discussion</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Spelling and grammatical errors <p>5REFERENCES Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>Can the authors include the most recent articles see examples below</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Metsihet Mohammed Nuru, Temesgen Bizuayehu Wube & Demissie Assegu Fenta (2023) Magnitude and Factors Associated with Cytopenia Among Children on Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy at Hawassa University College of Medicine and Health Science, Sidama Region, Southern Ethiopia, HIV/AIDS - Research and Palliative Care, 15: 145-155, DOI: 10.2147/HIV.S403923 ➤ Rajme-Lopez, Brenda Crabtree-Ramírez, Aldo A Acosta-Medina, Antonio Olivás-Martínez, Christianne Bourlon, HIV-positive patients presenting with peripheral blood cytopenias: is bone marrow assessment a priority? Haematology, Transfusion and Cell Therapy, Volume 44, Issue 4,2022, Pages 542-548, ISSN 2531-1379, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.htct.2021.02.008. (https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2531137921000493) ➤ Tsegay, Yakob Gebregziabher, et al. "Magnitude of cytopenias among HIV-infected children in Bahir Dar, northwest Ethiopia: a comparison of HAART-naïve and HAART-experienced children." <i>HIV/AIDS-Research and Palliative Care</i> (2017): 31-42. <p><i>I appreciate the effort the authors have made to prepare the article. The article has a degree of scientific thought but it is not making sense/ Aim puzzled was this article written using chatGPT- I apologise if this is offensive but something is not adding up.</i></p> | |
| <p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p> | <p>Poor English quality for a scientific article</p> | |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p> | | |

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|---|
| <p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p> | <p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p> | |

Review Form 1.7

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Name: | Gladys Opinya |
| Department, University & Country | University of Nairobi, Kenya |