

## Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	<b>International Journal of Environment and Climate Change</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_IJECC_93527</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>BIO-EVALUATION OF THE ECOLOGICAL HEALTH STATUS OF PETROLEUM EFFLUENT RECEIVING WATER OF ELEME RIVER, NIGERIA</b>
Type of the Article	

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalijecc.com/index.php/IJECC/editorial-policy> )

## Review Form 1.6

### PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>My comments</b></p> <p>Thank you for giving me the chance to review this interesting work.</p> <p>The work is dealing with “<b>Bio-Evaluation Of The Ecological Health Status Of Petroleum Effluent Receiving Water Of Eleme River, Nigeria</b>”. This work is very important for readers to improve their awareness of ecological risk assessment.</p> <p>The paper is carefully prepared but for more benefits of this work, some comments must be fixed before the publication of this paper.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. The title is precise for the core message of this research. Please see the revised manuscript</li><li>2. The introduction covered the enough period from the previous work from and this literature is satisfactory but for more benefits, I recommend adding some related references in water and wastewater treatments. I think it will add value and improve this manuscript.<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Ibrahim Abdelfattah, Wael Abdelwahab, and Ashraf M. El-Shamy, (2022). Environmental Remediation of Contaminated Wastewater with Ammonium Using Clay-Based Adsorbents, Nature Environment, and Pollution Technology, 21(4) (December), the Year 2022.</li><li>• Abdelfattah, I., El-Shamy, A. M. Chitosan as Potential De-coloring Agent for Synthetic and Textile Industrial Wastewater, Journal of Environmental Accounting and Management, 2022 10(3): 305–319.</li><li>• <a href="#">Ibrahim Abdelfattah, Wael Abdelwahab, Ashraf El-Shamy</a>, Montmorillonitic clay as a Cost-Effective, Eco Friendly and Sustainable Adsorbent for Physicochemical Treatment of Contaminated Water, Egypt. J. Chem. Vol. 65, No. 2 pp. 687 - 694 (2022). DOI: <a href="https://doi.org/10.21608/ejchem.2021.92320.4378">10.21608/ejchem.2021.92320.4378</a></li><li>• Ibrahim Abdelfattah, Fathy A. El Saied, Ali A. Almedolab, A. M. El Shamy, Biosorption as a Perfect Technique for Purification of Wastewater Contaminated with Ammonia, Applied Biochemistry, and Biotechnology, 1-30. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/s12010-021-03794-4">https://doi.org/10.1007/s12010-021-03794-4</a></li><li>• I. Abdelfattah, M. E. Abuarab, E. Mostafa, M. H. El-Awady, K. M. Aboelghait, A. M. El-Shamy, (2022) Integrated system for recycling and treatment of hazardous pharmaceutical wastewater, International Journal of Environmental Science and Technology, 1-10. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-022-04269-7">https://doi.org/10.1007/s13762-022-04269-7</a></li><li>• M. F. Shehata, S. El-Shafey, N. A. Ammar, A. M. El-Shamy, (2019). Reduction of Cu<sup>+2</sup> and Ni<sup>+2</sup> ions from wastewater using mesoporous adsorbent: effect of treated wastewater on corrosion behavior of steel pipelines, Egypt. J. Chem. 62(9), 1587-1602. DOI: <a href="https://doi.org/10.21608/ejchem.2019.7967.1627">10.21608/ejchem.2019.7967.1627</a></li><li>• Emad El-Kashef, A. M. El-Shamy, Ahmed Abdo, Elshafie A. M. Gad and Amr A. Gado, (2019). Effect of Magnetic Treatment of Potable Water in Looped and Dead-End Water Networks, Egypt. J. Chem. 62(8), 1467-1481. DOI: <a href="https://doi.org/10.21608/ejchem.2019.7268.1595">10.21608/ejchem.2019.7268.1595</a></li><li>• A. M. El-Shamy, Ibrahim Abdelfattah, Ola I. Elshafie, M. F. Shehata, (2018). Potential removal of organic loads from petroleum wastewater and its effect on the corrosion behavior of municipal networks, J. Environ. Management, 219, 325-331. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2018.04.074">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2018.04.074</a></li><li>• A. M. El-Shamy, Hala K. Farag, W. M. Saad, (2017). Comparative Study of Removal of Heavy Metals from Industrial Wastewater Using Clay and Activated Carbon in Batch and Continuous Flow Systems, Egyptian Journal of Chemistry 60(6), 1165-1175. DOI: <a href="https://doi.org/10.21608/ejchem.2017.1606.1128">10.21608/ejchem.2017.1606.1128</a></li></ul></li><li>3. The experimental work is satisfied.</li><li>4. The results are promising, and I have no comments about this part of the research.</li><li>5. The conclusion is well written but needs one more sentence to highlight the benefits of this work in application because the results are very promising and could be used for commercial uses.</li></ol>	

**Review Form 1.6**

	6. The references are listed according to the requirements of the journal. 7. The paper contains some minor editing and grammatical mistakes. Please see the attached revised manuscript I recommend publishing this paper after minor revision for editing and grammatical revision, updating the conclusion part, and adding some related references.	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments		
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Ashraf El-Shamy</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>National Research Centre, Egypt</b>