

Review Form 1.7

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name: | South Asian Journal of Research in Microbiology |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_SAJRM_95706 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Biofilm Production in Borehole Water Sources and their Susceptibility to Antibiotics and Antibiofilm effect of Noni Foliar extracts |
| Type of the Article | |

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalsajrm.com/index.php/SAJRM/editorial-policy>)

PART 1: Review Comments

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|---|
| <p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p> | <p>1. The manuscript provides the readers with a brief description of the bacteria colonizing the borehole water sources in 3 regions in Nigeria. Despite the highlighted antibiofilm effect of Noni Foliar extracts in the title, the discussion of the antibiofilm effect in the manuscript is minimal. The bacteria and their relative antimicrobial resistance reported are of low impact as boiling the water could kill most of the mentioned bacteria from the water source. Thus, the reported bacteria resistance is not clinically significant and useful.</p> <p>2. The title should be more relevant if the author adds more information and discuss in-depth the antibiofilm mechanism and effects in the discussion section of the manuscript.</p> <p>3. Yes.</p> <p>4. Some important information is missing from the methods in the manuscript. Despite the author mentioned about the origin of the Noni leaves, however, the extract process was not described in the method. Besides, the determination of phytochemical components were referred to reference 46, which does not clearly explain the process of extracting and describing the chemical compounds.</p> <p>The discussion part is poorly written with main focus on the bacteria isolated and their resistance to the antibiotics. The antibiogram of the bacteria should already be well-documented worldwide, thus, it is not necessary for the author to focus too much on the part. Instead, the antibiofilm effect should be emphasized and more discussion should be made on the Noni Foliar.</p> <p>5. Major improvements were needed to ensure the published manuscript to sound scientifically correct.</p> <p>6. Yes.</p> | |
| <p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p> | Strongly recommend for English editing and proofreading to correct the grammar and flow. | |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p> | Not applicable | |

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|--|---|
| <p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p> | <p>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</p> | |

Review Form 1.7

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Name: | Lim Ming Chiang |
| Department, University & Country | Hospital Sultan Haji Ahmad Shah, Malaysia |