

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Case Reports in Surgery
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJCRS_96045
Title of the Manuscript:	RARE ASSOCIATION OF AN AGGRESSIVE GIANT CELL TUMOR WITH XERODERMA PIGMENTOSUM
Type of the Article	Case study

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajcrs.com/index.php/AJCRS/editorial-policy>)

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</p>	<p>1. Yes. The author reported a case of a 17-year-old patient with an association of XP and TCG which would be the second case reported in the literature.</p> <p>2. Yes</p> <p>3. Yes</p> <p>4. Yes for case report.</p> <p>5. Minor - the abbreviations for the name Giant cell tumors (GCTs) or (TCG) should be reviewed</p> <p>Necessary – pag 2 author mentioned “At present there are no studies that have shown the involvement of a protein in the pathogenesis of giant cell tumors.” when in fact “An over-expression of the cell cycle regulating protein cyclin D1 was established in GCT and in the central giant cell granuloma of the jaw (Kauzman A, Li SQ, Bradley G, Bell RS, Wunder JS, Kandel R. Central giant cell granuloma of the jaws: assessment of cell cycle proteins. <i>J Oral Pathol Med.</i> 2004;33:170–176. doi: 10.1111/j.0904-2512.2004.00101.x.)”</p> <p>6. Yes</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Sufficient</p> <p>Minor revision requirements (see pct 5 above)</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Igna Cornel
Department, University & Country	University of Agricultural Science and Veterinary Medicine of Banat, Romania