

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>Journal of Education, Society and Behavioural Science</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JESBS_110339</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Exploring Transformative Learning through the Analysis of Visual Representations in Teaching Practice: Presentation of an Applicative Example</b>
Type of the Article	

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>This article is very representative today. One of the demands of digitalization is providing visualization in learning. As stated in this research, the aim is to propose a new approach to visual material used in the learning process. The function of visual media is to attract attention, clarify the presentation of ideas, illustrate facts that are easy for students to digest and enjoy</b></li> <li>2. <b>Make the title simpler and clearer (Exploring Transformative Learning through the Analysis of Visual Representations in Applicative Teaching)</b></li> <li>3. <b>The abstract does not yet characterize the fundamental research. Abstracts should not just state the problem but specifically include objectives, methods, units of analysis, data, and research results. The abstract also needs to have an implementation tool for analyzing visuals.</b></li> <li>4. <b>It is necessary to recheck and add literature reviews for each keyword&gt;&gt; transformative learning, visual representations, visual design, teaching methodology, multimodality.</b></li> <li>5. <b>It requires an additional explanation of the research problem, explaining the theoretical perspective (theory of Transformative Learning) that underlies it in the literature review, and adding clear research stages in the research method.</b></li> <li>6. <b>Bibliography/References could be more present. The references are too old, while the content discusses digitalization and transformation, which means modern times. Apart from all the ancient authorities, it is also limited.</b></li> </ol> <p><b>Can be added, such as:</b>  <b>Please visit: Journal of Education, Society and Behavioral Science, and see</b>  Willmott, T. J., Hurley, E., &amp; Rundle-Thiele, S. (2022). Designing energy solutions: a comparison of two participatory design approaches for service innovation. <i>Journal of Service Theory and Practice</i>, 32(3), 353-377. doi:10.1108/jstp-03-2021-0040  Zong, Y., Wu, J., Yu, K., &amp; Yang, X. (2023). Efficiency benchmarking and its determinants in high-speed railways: Reference for China. <i>Research in Transportation Economics</i>, 102. doi:10.1016/j.retrec.2023.101355</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>7. <b>Others:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Please make the introduction easier for laypeople to understand. At least start by explaining why this research was carried out and what theory was borrowed as a basis for perspective to be more focused.</b></li> <li>2. <b>Please clarify the concepts of transformative learning, visual representations, and visual methods. Like mentioning the newest references. How to build and synthesize the concept of transformative learning.</b></li> </ol> </li> </ol>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>	<p>Refine again and according to the systematic writing of scientific articles</p>	

## Review Form 1.7

<b>Optional/General</b> comments	There are three main problems in this paper. This problem is (1) the abstract issue must be completed; (2) the introduction must be more accessible for lay people to understand by mentioning the background of the problem, gaps, what research model will be offered, and (3) what theory is used as a solid reference for strengthen novelty or be able to solve research problems; and others, please check JESBS template.	
----------------------------------	--	--

### **PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

### **Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Mariana Simanjuntak</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Institut Teknologi Del, Universitas Diponegoro, Indonesia</b>