

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_108640
Title of the Manuscript:	An Assessment of Mangrove Ecosystem Condition by Foliar Stable Nitrogen Isotope Ratio Index in Okinawa
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</p>	<p>1. Field studies and direct monitoring of mangrove forests are a challenge because the location is relatively difficult to access and requires hard work to do so. Therefore, this research is important because it is develop possibility to assess mangrove quality through only based on the leaf analysis by stable nitrogen isotope ratio.</p> <p>2. The title: Add the name of the country where the study was conducted</p> <p>3. Abstract has been well prepared and comprehensive.</p> <p>4. The structure of the paper is sufficient and flows well.</p> <p>5. In general, papers meet the standard rules of scientific work.</p> <p>6. The number of references is sufficient, but papers from the last 10 years are only around 36%. Need to be update.</p> <p>7. Methods:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Further describe the species in the study area, and the reasons for choosing the samples. Mentioning the dominant species without supporting data is not strong in basis. - Add a map of the study sites (islands, mangrove areas, and anthropogenic areas). 	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	yes	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Tri Atmoko
Department, University & Country	Research Center of Applied Zoology, Indonesia