

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>Asian Journal of Agricultural and Horticultural Research</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_AJHR_109076</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Assessment of the effect of Garcinia kola (Clusiaceae) on the carbon sequestration capacity and productivity of cocoa (Theobroma cacao L) in cocoa-based agroforestry systems</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory REVISION comments</b></p> <p>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></p> <p>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></p> <p>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></p> <p>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></p> <p><b>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</b></p> <p><b>Field work</b></p> <p>English language</p>	<p><b>Yes but this manuscript need to be update and reorganised</b></p> <p><b>No is too long, I suggested the author have to reduce it, for example <b>Assessment of the effect of <i>Garcinia kola</i> on the carbon sequestration capacity and productivity of <i>Theobroma cacao</i> in agroforestry systems</b> or other similar short title</b></p> <p><b>Not weel</b></p> <p><b>IMRAD, the authors have to understand this approach</b></p> <p><b>No it need to be well presented</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Manourová, A.; Chinheya, I.P.; Kalousová, M.; Ruiz-Chután, J.A.; Okafor, U.C.; Tchoundjeu, Z.; Tsobeng, A.; Van Damme, P.; Lojka, B. Domestication Potential of <i>Garcinia kola</i> Heckel (Clusiaceae): Searching for Diversity in South Cameroon. <i>Plants</i> 2023, 12, 742. <a href="https://doi.org/10.3390/">https://doi.org/10.3390/</a></li> <li>- PROTA. <i>Garcinia kola</i> Heckel. Available online: <a href="https://prota4u.org/database/protav8.asp?g=psk&amp;p=Garcinia+kola+Heckel">https://prota4u.org/database/protav8.asp?g=psk&amp;p=Garcinia+kola+Heckel</a> (accessed on 13 November 2023).</li> <li>- Vivien F &amp; Faure J.J. 2011. Les arbres des forêts denses d'Afrique Centrale...</li> <li>- Agyili, J.; Sacande, M.; Koffi, E.; Peprah, T. Improving the Collection and Germination of West African <i>Garcinia Kola</i> Heckel Seeds. <i>New For.</i> 2007, 34, 269–279.</li> <li>- Yogom, B.T.; Avana-Tientcheu, M.-L.; Mboujda, M.F.M.; Momo, S.T.; Fonkou, T.; Tsobeng, A.; Barnaud, A.; Duminil, J. Ethnicity Differences in Uses and Management Practices of Bitter Kola Trees (<i>Garcinia Kola</i>) in Cameroon. <i>Econ. Bot.</i> 2020, 74, 429–444.</li> <li>- Dadjo, C.; Toyi, M.; Nyende, A.B.; Salako, K.V.; Assogbadjo, A.E. Impact of Land-Use on Tree and Fruit Morphometric Variation of the Bitter Kola (<i>Garcinia Kola</i> Heckel) in Benin: Insight for Domestication and Production. <i>J. Hortic. For.</i> 2018, 10, 127–134.</li> <li>- WFO; Beech, E.; Hills, R.; Rivers, M.C.; Oldfield, S.F.; Smith, P.P. World Flora Online, <i>Garcinia kola</i> Heckel 2022. Available online: <a href="http://www.worldfloraonline.org/taxon/wfo-0000694394">http://www.worldfloraonline.org/taxon/wfo-0000694394</a> (accessd on 13 November 2023)</li> <li>- PROTA. <i>Thobroma cacao</i> L. Available online: <a href="https://prota4u.org/database/protav8.asp?g=psk&amp;p=Theobroma+cacao+L">https://prota4u.org/database/protav8.asp?g=psk&amp;p=Theobroma+cacao+L</a> (accessed on 13 November 2023...</li> <li>- Kouame, Stanislas T.M., Tahi, G., Sekou, A., Cilas, C., Akaffou S. D. 2021. Evaluation of New High-Producing Hybrids of Cocoa Trees in Marginal Crop Areas in Côte d'Ivoire. <i>Agricultural Sciences</i>, 12(12)</li> <li>- <a href="#">Jheiner Vásquez-García</a>, <a href="#">Julio Cesar Santos-Pelaez</a>,<sup>a</sup> <a href="#">Roiber Malqui-Ramos</a>,<sup>a</sup> <a href="#">Carmen N. Vigo</a>,<sup>b</sup> <a href="#">Wigoberto Alvarado C.</a>,<sup>a</sup> and <a href="#">Leidy G. Bobadilla</a> 2022. Agromorphological characterization of cacao (<i>Theobroma cacao</i> L.) accessions from the germplasm bank of the National Institute of Agrarian Innovation, Peru</li> <li>-</li> <li>-</li> <li>- Please update your bibliography</li> </ul>	

**Review Form 1.7**

	<p>The different process in field work is very capital for your paper, please can you explain it well, clearly and practically. If you have picture of this work, it would be important to had them</p> <p>If English is not your native language you can't check software to ameliorated this paper</p>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>		
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Translate the name of country Ivory Coast in English Côte d'Ivoire in French</li> <li>b. Translate the legend of Fig. 1 and 2 in English</li> <li>c. Your methodology is not clear.</li> <li>d. For biomass estimation, is it a destructive or a non-destructive method, I think that you used standing trees?</li> <li>e. Which kind of instruments were used for taking two dendrometric parameters dbh and height, please name them and describe clearly this capital process for your study</li> <li>f. Write correctly <math>g.cm^{-3}</math> in entire paperwork</li> <li>g. Write the correct names of this two tree species <i>Garcinia kola</i> and <i>Theobroma cacao</i>, you can checkout in PROTAdatabase, in botanical database Kew, Meise...</li> <li>h. Please in section Mat and Metho. After study site sub section you can had a second section with botanical presentation of this species <i>Garcinia kola</i> see in prota database and <i>Theobroma cacao</i></li> <li>i. Please be clear about the presence of <i>Garcinia kola</i> in the cocoa agroforestry system, is it the domesticated tree or old tree, who was there before the implementation of agroforestry</li> <li>j. Can you provide the years old of different cacao farms</li> <li>k. Where is geographical localisation of different cocoa agroforestry system</li> <li>l. Have you take the geographical localisation of different cocoa tree...</li> <li>m. Please check if there is not specific equation for estimation of biomass cocoa tree</li> </ul>	

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	Yves Achille Amougou Ndi
Department, University & Country	University of Yaoundé I, Cameroon