

## Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Advances in Agricultural Research</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJAAR_104253
Title of the Manuscript:	Economic analysis of the coffee market in Rwanda
Type of the Article	Research Article

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajaar.com/index.php/AJAAR/editorial-policy> )

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li><b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li><b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li><b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p style="text-align: center;">"Economic Analysis of the Coffee Market in Rwanda" ((needs a sub-title)) AJAAR 104253                      REVIEW</p> <p>This manuscript provides useful ideas and extensive information on the coffee market in Rwanda. There is a need for careful editing throughout the manuscript before being acceptable for publication in AJAAR.</p> <p>As it was submitted to AJAAR, the lengthy manuscript would be better presented as two separate articles. One article would focus on a compare-contrast analysis of the economics of coffee production in Rwanda with other countries in Africa as well as elsewhere in the world. This version is what this review focuses on making possible. Another article would focus on a country-focused compare-contrast essay on what conditions most affect the production of coffee within the socio-political-economic conditions that form the foundation of social life in Rwanda. This effort could be re-written and re-submitted to AJAAR, or, if the author chooses, it could be effectively written and submitted to another journal.</p> <p>Sections for the submitted manuscript include <b>Introduction</b>, sub-sections Methodology and Results, and <b>Conclusion</b> (term needs to be singular) ---- Missing is a <b>Discussion</b>. Another potential section, <b>Limitations</b> (this is generally pluralized), can be the final brief section that appears before <b>References</b>.</p> <p>Aspects of the writing and presentational organization of the manuscript that require editing: missing spaces between phrases in several places (conjoined), grammatical inconsistencies throughout the writing, numbered References [appropriately alphabetized] AND in-the-text citation of author surname(s) [appropriate], sometimes complete / sometimes incomplete titles to Tables and Figures (each needs to be Capitalized) that would be easier for the reader if the title were consistently ABOVE with the cited source that appears BELOW each one.</p> <p>The Tables and Figures are succinct and easy-to-read. Especially effective is the use of colors that represent specific aspects of the content.</p> <p>Please note that the title of an article should be capitalized inside quotation marks, as appears above. Current title is descriptive and would benefit by having an interpretive sub-title, which can be incorporated AFTER the full essay is revised. A sub-title would clarify what is the specific focus of the article manuscript.</p> <p>ABSTRACT: The 179-word Abstract identifies aspects of Rwanda coffee production with no mention how important coffee is in many areas of in the world. Phrase "particularly in developing infrastructure impacted by the genocide and implementing policies to ensure sustainable growth" is unclear. Later the phrase "genocide and civil war" appears on page 5, which clarifies an important time period in Rwanda national history that should include the time period in which this took place.</p> <p>Page One, first paragraph: The opening sentence is missing a term, "and in most countries it is an integral part of food culture" ---- Another possible phrase is "national foodways" which incorporates a term that is often used to describe a national and/or regional and/or urban and/or rural and/or ethnic and/or religious "food culture."</p> <p>First appearance of in-the-text citation does not need an author's middle initial, unless there are two authors with the same surname. In-the-text author initials and/or first names that appear throughout the manuscript are superfluous (not needed ---- these can be removed).</p> <p>Rather than abbreviation "60kg" the full term "60 kilograms" should be used here and elsewhere where abbreviations appear in the manuscript.</p> <p>The first of many conjoined phrases should be "(Giuli 2021). The coffee market &lt;&gt;&lt;&gt; expected to be more than 433 billion U.S. dollars in 2022" --- Interestingly, the year 2022 is more than six months earlier than the time this manuscript was submitted, which may represent the time period in which the manuscript was researched and written. Otherwise, the current year 2023 needs to be</p>	

Review Form 1.7

	<p>incorporated.</p> <p>Page One, second paragraph: Phrase “in all aspects of the coffee value chain” is unclear and requires clarification. Is ‘coffee value chain’ a common expression for how others view the production and exportation of coffee, which is not consumed internally within regions and/or an entire country? Phrase “where more than 75% of the labour force comes from the agriculture sector of which coffee is a major crop” ---- this latter phrase needs to clarify that 75% of the labour force is employed in the agricultural sector, if that proportion is correct. The term “Furthermore” is extraneous (not needed -- it can be removed).</p> <p>Page One, third paragraph (continues on next page): Phrase “due to insufficient amount of cherries to attract demand from off-taker” requires clarification for “cherries” and for “off-taker.” What are each of these? Also, rather than “due to,” more correct would be “owing to” ---- thus, “due to” needs to be revised throughout the manuscript where it appears. Phrase “no skills” on the next page requires clarification.</p> <p>Page Two, second paragraph: Editing is required for clarification of this three-sentence paragraph: “In 2002 the Rwanda government implemented a national coffee strategy to position Rwanda as a county producing specialty coffee. They worked extensive with global private sector and international donors in their endeavor to ensure Rwanda’s position as a specialty coffee producer. As a result, the regulatory framework of an economic sector that was once in shamble was modified, infra-structure was developed, and external market links were developed between national coffee producers and foreign buyers” It would be helpful to the reader to identify special interest groups and similar entities that are part of the private sector.</p> <p>Page Two, third paragraph: Commas are missing in 20,459 and 17,000 and 584,790. For the benefit of readers, term “tonnes” should be written “ton” (English). It would be clearer if the closing was a separate sentence, which identifies Rwanda as “among the top ten winners of the International Barista Championship,” which appears to be a very good indicator of Rwanda’s position among other countries, considering that this competition was international (worldwide). The abbreviation in the final in-text citation requires a space “(RDB, n.d.)”</p> <p>Page Two, Methodology: The first sentence is superfluous (not needed). Better stated would be, “The research design included quantifiable information that was obtained from several sources” &lt;&gt;&lt;&gt; The short phrase “observation and measurement” cannot be considered valid, as there is no indication that the author collected real-world data by field observations in Rwanda. Near the end of the paragraph, it is mentioned that “This information was derived from material published in” &lt;&gt;&lt;&gt; which is an appropriate way to describe “secondary research”</p> <p>Page Three, Figure 1, and Page Four, Figure 2. These two figures appear abruptly, because there is no description of coffee drying or coffee washing that appears in-the-text on Pages 3-4. Instead, three paragraphs on Page 4 describe economic recoveries that Rwanda achieved, “since the 1994 genocide and civil war.” Also, the authors cited for Figure 1 represent a four-author source, which is awkwardly presented in References. These four authors are Chala, Bilhat, Hans Oeschner, Sajid Latif, and Joachim Müller, who would be cited in-the-text, as “(Chala, Oeschner, Latif, and Müller 2018)” and other places wherever this nicely sketched Figure appears in-the-text. ‘Coffee washing’ is not discussed till Page 16 in the manuscript and again in the closing paragraph on Page 39. However, ‘coffee drying’ (with or without a hyphen) only appears in the title to Figure 1 and as one of the five process steps in the first column, Wet Method. Four of the five steps are appropriately action-identifying gerunds [pulping, fermentation &amp; washing, drying, peeling &amp; polishing]. Not clear is the final process step, “Green beans” which re-appears in the third column technique, Dry Method. Apparently, “green beans” are a form of coffee bean, possibly representing an early stage of preparation. Green beans also are an edible vegetable in many places, which most likely most readers will recognize.</p>	
--	---	--

Review Form 1.7

	<p>Pages 4-39: It would help the reader to identify the appropriate Figure and/or Table in-the-text, which are designed to illustrate the ongoing description. This is the general purpose of Figures and/or Tables that author(s) include in a manuscript.</p> <p>Page Four: Figure 2. Title to this figure would better read, "Figure 2. Quality of Coffee in Rwanda National Coffee Strategy Target Goals for Washed Coffee"</p> <p>Page Four, Results: This section describes Rwanda's economy and continues over more pages. Several important aspects of Rwanda's economy are described. Coffee is not mentioned till Page 10 as an agricultural export, which includes "coffee, tea, hides and skins, pyrethrum (requires a brief definition), and horticulture (which most likely encompasses edible cash crops as well as plants that are used for home ornamentation and/or household decorations. "GDP" requires the full name, before using the acronym GDP. In the penultimate paragraph, the full range of years is required "(2008-2012)" and a space for the final mention "(2013-2018) that resulted" &lt;&gt;&lt;&gt; For the reader's benefit, RWF requires its full name in the final paragraph.</p> <p>Page 5: Grammatical inconsistencies that appear on these pages include a missing period (.) after Figure 3. ---- "UN" would better read with full name, United Nations (UN), before using the acronym, UN. World Bank requires capitalization. This term is rarely abbreviated with an acronym. A space is required for "Nominal GDP Per Capita United States (US) dollars (\$) Phrase "Axis Title" appears below Figure 6 and again on Figure 10. It would help the reader to identify what this means OR replace it with a correct phrase.</p> <p>Page 6: Title requires a period and Capitalization &gt; Figure 4. Rwanda GDP Per Capita. Source requires capitalization IMF, World Economic Outlook Database, October 2021), which similarly applies to Figure 5. Rwanda Population with capitalization of Source</p> <p>Page 7: It would help reader comprehension, if there was a clarification of how Rwanda's national population is structured, as well as highly urbanized and mostly rural. It would read better if the same aspects of compare-and-contrast were incorporated, namely, overall size, increase from 2010 to 2019 (when rural increase was greater), and statistical proportions for the overall population by three often-used age ranges: 0-14 and 15-64 and 65-and-over.</p> <p>Page 9: The mention of 2010/2011 is unclear, because Figure 9 presents data for 2011 through 2019. Is the full year 2010 included? The phrase "Consumer Price Index (CPI)" effectively provides the full meaning with its acronym, CPI, which is used thereafter.</p> <p>Page 10: Better stated would be "4.2 Contribution of Agriculture to the Economy" which capitalizes each of the three key terms. The two paragraphs that support 4.2 are effectively phrased in describing the importance of agriculture to Rwanda's economy. The closing sentence might better appear as the second sentence AND the second sentence would better serve as the closing idea. The four elements "coffee, tea, hides and skins, pyrethrum and horticulture" require clarification: "hides and skins" leaves open a potential for animal husbandry to include products other than expected meats, such as (alphabetical) eggs, meats, milk that are produced through animal husbandry. Term "pyrethrum" requires a definition and/or clarification what is produced and/or what is the original source, before it is processed to become "pyrethrum." Is this an edible product of some type OR another useful by-product from plant sources? The process of "horticulture" requires clarification whether this refers to an early stage of plant production, before high-input high-yield agriculture was developed. Actual plant parts yield a variety of edible products (alphabetical): foliage, fruits, leaves, nuts, roots, seeds, stems. Interestingly, "Green Coffee" is listed as the tenth crop in a list that appears to be arranged</p>	
--	--	--

Review Form 1.7

	<p>sequentially by annual yields. The first three food-crops on the list are those that appear to be the essential foods consumed by people in Rwanda.</p> <p>Page 13, 4.2 Coffee Production in Rwanda: It is not till Page 13 that the in-the-text discussion includes coffee, which focuses on the “area harvested, yield and quantity.” However, what actually is presented, as shown in Figure 14 World Coffee Area Harvested, is the amount of land that is under cultivation.</p> <p>The second and third paragraphs on Page 13 describe how Rwanda “is considered a small producer with growing potential” ---- Term “growing” is confusing, because it can refer to the capacity of Rwanda to increase its potential for greater coffee production for exportation OR it could refer to Rwanda’s internal agricultural capacity for production for its national and/or regional populations. It would be appropriate to clarify more clearly what is the intended meaning of growing potential.</p> <p>Comparing Figure 14 “World Coffee Area Harvested” that suggests a rather consistent trend of global coffee production, versus a declining trend that is implied in Figure 15 Rwanda Coffee Area Harvested, wherein the lowest years comprise 2015-2019, which were among the highest for global coffee production. Highest year for global production was 2019, which was the lowest year for Rwanda coffee harvests.</p> <p>Page 16: According to Figure 16 Regional Coffee Yield Rate, the world continents of Asia, Oceania and the Americas have a high coffee yield rate that begins to increase slightly, beginning in 2016, whereas the trend for Africa begins to increase in 2017 before beginning to decline in 2018 and 2019.</p> <p>The text that accompanies Figure 16 indicates that Rwanda was rated tenth in 2019, which suggests that less production of coffee in a substantial number of African countries lowers the overall average, when this average is compared with the rest of the world.</p> <p>Page 16. Table 2 ranks the world’s top twenty coffee producers. Among African nations, Ghana is ranked eight, Rwanda is ranked tenth, Nigeria is ranked eleventh, and Burundi is ranked twentieth.</p> <p>Page 20: The acronym “NAEB appears in the opening sentence. The full name should be written in full the first time that this term appears in the manuscript. “Farmer Feed Schools (FFS) in contrast identifies the full name.</p> <p>Page 21, first paragraph: The source “(Woodsie, B. 2020)” does NOT appear in the full list of References.</p> <p>Page 22: There is an interesting alternative process that demonstrates how a variety of different scenarios can affect how countries are ranked as coffee producers AND coffee exporters. Germany “was the fifth exporting country in 2019,” owing to “their re-exporting coffee from Rwanda and Uganda” ---- Interestingly, Ethiopia and Uganda “were the only African countries in the top ten of global exporters in 2019”</p> <p>The author(s) will need to decide whether Table 2 Coffee Yield Rate global top 20 producers (p. 16) OR Table 3 Coffee Production in the World Top 20 Producing Countries best illustrates-substantiates the argumentation for the globalized trends that will appear in the final version of this manuscript. Table 2 includes Malawi, Rwanda, Nigeria and Burundi ---- However, Rwanda and Nigeria are missing in Table 3, which mentions Ethiopia [top producer in Africa], Uganda, Kenya, United Republic of Tanzania and Burundi, which are missing in Table 2 ---- In contrast, Table 4 Africa top coffee producers lists Ethiopia [first], Uganda [second] United Republic of Tanzania [fifth], Kenya [sixth], Cameroon [seventh], Guinea [eighth], Democratic Republic of the Congo [ninth], Rwanda [tenth], Burundi [eleventh], Togo [twelfth], Angola [thirteenth], Central African Republic [fourteenth], Malawi [fifteenth], Zambia [sixteenth], Equatorial Guinea [seventeenth], Congo [eighteenth], Nigeria [twentieth].</p> <p>At times, the names of African countries vary, for example, “Guinea” and “Equatorial Guinea.” For consistency, the author(s) can decide how each country will be identified through the appearance of the same name in-the-text across all of the Tables and all of the Figures.</p> <p>Page 23, Table 5 Top Coffee Exporters: African countries include among the 26 listed include</p>	
--	--	--

Review Form 1.7

	<p>Ethiopia [seventh], Uganda [eighth], Côte d'Ivoire [sixteenth], Tanzania [eighteenth], Kenya [nineteenth], Cameroon [twenty-third], Rwanda (twenty-sixth)</p> <p>Pages 24-25, Table 6 African Top Coffee Exporters lists twenty countries in which Rwanda is listed seventh, behind Ethiopia, Uganda, Côte d'Ivoire, United Republic of Tanzania, Kenya, Cameroon.</p> <p>Page 26, second paragraph: Better phrased would be "First, there was an economic crisis in Europe leading to lower prices from the region, causing most producers to seek markets elsewhere (NAEB, 2012). Second, there was an increased global supply of coffee during that period, which also led to countries that sought alternative markets"</p> <p>Page 26, fourth paragraph: A space is needed for "between 2010 and 204 to 8,906 tons between 2015 and 2019"</p> <p>Page 30, third paragraph: Possibly the first sentence should read "Belgium, Switzerland and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland were" &lt;&gt;&lt;&gt; Missing is mention of Wales and Scotland, as the other two countries that comprise the four-country United Kingdom. Some writers consider Ireland as comprising Northern Ireland and Southern Ireland, whereas others use Ireland. There is a historical conflict that led to the Northern / Southern division of Ireland. The people nonetheless are considered to be "Irish."</p> <p>Page 31, first paragraph: A corrected verb form in the third sentence would be "Between 2017 and 2019, exports to Australia decreased to 79 tons"</p> <p>Page 34, first paragraph: This paragraph introduces the interesting practice of using "storage facilities in an attempt to reduce the vulnerability of the coffee sector to global price volatility (Agritrade, 2014)" The phrase "global price volatility" requires re-wording for clarity OR a short phrase that describes what is meant.</p> <p>Page 35, Table 8: This table identifies the longest list of countries, which total twenty-seven. Some clarification should be included in one of the three paragraphs that appear below the table.</p> <p>Page 36, third paragraph: There is a missing preposition in the opening sentence that should read, "Rwanda exported 4,950 tons of coffee to Uganda" &lt;&gt;&lt;&gt;</p> <p>Page 37: Hopefully, most readers will recognize that "United States of America" is abbreviated "USA"</p> <p>Page 38, Table 9: This table that presents data on Rwanda's Top Coffee Importers requires a descriptive paragraph or two</p> <p>Page 39: Most authors and professional journals consider the final section of an article is Conclusion (singular). These three paragraphs will require revision that emphasizes the focus of global actions in relation to coffee production, and, importantly, coffee importation and coffee exportation. Thus, commentary on the historic "colonial era" and "climatic and environmental conditions" and "poor soil and pest management, poor management of waste stations, poor transport infra-structure and land ownership problems" will be more appropriate for another paper that was suggested earlier in this review.</p> <p>Pages 40-42, <b>References:</b> There are various inconsistencies in the bibliography at the end of the manuscript that will require additional information, as well as careful editing of the format for presenting these sources. Inclusion of a publication date varies with some enclosed in (parentheses) and some listed as the year, followed by a period (.). Several lack a publication date: (6), (9), (10), (16), (18), (28), (32), (39), (48). Several References are incomplete and will require elaboration with the missing details, which usually are names of sources where an article or a book or journal name or news report are</p>	
--	---	--

**Review Form 1.7**

	<p>available. When a source is listed as available online, it is necessary to identify the author and the publication. Generally, someone within the organization will be listed as the author (or authors). It is expected that "date accessed ****" appears with publications that were available online. Missing information especially applies to sources for (1), (2), (9), (10), (11), (12), (13), (14), (19), (20), (22), (24), (26), (30), (36), (37), (38), (44). As mentioned in the above review, the inclusion of numbers is not necessary.</p> <p>It appears that nearly all of the consulted literature is available online in one form or another. However, it appears that no more than three online sources have a Digital Object Identifier (DOI or doi), which indicates a publication that has appeared in a formal publication and/or identifies a more established professional journal.</p> <p>Please see above comments --- the title needs a sub-title</p> <p>Please see above comments</p> <p>Please see above comments --- what appears is appropriate, what is missing requires inclusion</p> <p>Please see above comments --- the information appears to have been chosen selectively</p> <p>Please see above comments --- References will require a thorough revision</p>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. <b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>	<p>Please see above comments --- grammatical inconsistencies are identified in the above comments</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>		

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b></p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

**Reviewer Details:**

<p>Name:</p>	<p><b>Keith V. Bletzer</b></p>
<p>Department, University &amp; Country</p>	<p><b>School of Human Evolution and Social Change, Arizona State University, USA</b></p>