



**SDI EDITORIAL COMMENTS FORM**

EDITORIAL COMMENT'S on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to editor's comments																																																																																														
<p>The analytical part of the study, namely <i>Discussion and Conclusion</i>, is <i>completely flawed</i>.</p> <p>This results from experimental data <i>not</i> being subsequently submitted to elementary statistical test of significance, as rightly emphasised by one Reviewer. Unfortunately, the Authors have not accounted for this deficiency in their study.</p> <p>And – still more unfortunately – it turns out that the main diagnostic point of the study, according to which 'German shepherd' would be more susceptible to Canine Ehrlichiosis than other dog breeds reveals, indeed, <i>completely inexact</i>, as soon as one relevantly looks at the displayed experimental data <i>from a statistical point of view</i> (see Chi-2 test 17x4 in Table below). One can thus observe that the only statistically significant difference which is actually highlighted is the marked positive sensitivity of the male of the "Cross" breed.</p> <p>While the intuitive, but false, appreciation of the Authors likely results from their (methodologically wrongly) comparing the differences in terms of <i>absolute</i> numbers, which of course tend to magnify differences for the 'German shepherd' sample (386 individuals) as the latter is far larger than any of the others.</p> <p>Pedagogically, this is a truly demonstrative example of the risks of biased – here false – diagnostic resulting from neglecting statistical tests to be applied to experimental data.</p> <p>Nevertheless, the experimental results, as such, are, by themselves, of <i>true interest</i>, as soon as the (mostly wrong) aspects of the Discussion and Conclusion sections are <i>delated</i>.</p> <p>Table: Chi-2 test performed on experimental data provided in the manuscript</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="284 1129 952 1667"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Breed</th> <th>Infected</th> <th>Healthy</th> <th>Infected</th> <th>Healthy</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Male</th> <th>Male</th> <th>Female</th> <th>Female</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr><td>German shepherd</td><td>0,8</td><td>0,0</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,1</td></tr> <tr><td>Local</td><td>1,0</td><td>0,3</td><td>2,6</td><td>0,0</td></tr> <tr><td>Lulu</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,6</td><td>2,3</td><td>0,2</td></tr> <tr><td>Cross</td><td><b>38,9</b></td><td>0,9</td><td>0,5</td><td>0,6</td></tr> <tr><td>Perro de Presa Can</td><td>0,5</td><td>0,2</td><td>0,4</td><td>0,2</td></tr> <tr><td>Rottweiler</td><td>0,3</td><td>0,0</td><td>1,5</td><td>0,0</td></tr> <tr><td>Royal black</td><td>0,2</td><td>3,1</td><td>2,6</td><td>3,9</td></tr> <tr><td>Rood dog</td><td>0,2</td><td>3,2</td><td>0,2</td><td>3,8</td></tr> <tr><td>Golden Retriever</td><td>0,2</td><td>1,1</td><td>0,2</td><td>1,5</td></tr> <tr><td>Malinois</td><td>0,2</td><td>0,6</td><td>0,2</td><td>0,3</td></tr> <tr><td>Griffon</td><td>0,1</td><td>1,3</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,8</td></tr> <tr><td>Caucasian</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,4</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,6</td></tr> <tr><td>Alabi</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,2</td></tr> <tr><td>American bulldog</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,0</td><td>0,1</td><td>0,0</td></tr> <tr><td>Saluki</td><td>0,1</td><td>1,3</td><td>0,1</td><td>1,0</td></tr> <tr><td>Balboa</td><td>0,0</td><td>0,6</td><td>0,0</td><td>0,5</td></tr> <tr><td>Husky</td><td>0,0</td><td>0,6</td><td>0,0</td><td>0,5</td></tr> </tbody> </table>	Breed	Infected	Healthy	Infected	Healthy	Male	Male	Female	Female	German shepherd	0,8	0,0	0,1	0,1	Local	1,0	0,3	2,6	0,0	Lulu	0,1	0,6	2,3	0,2	Cross	<b>38,9</b>	0,9	0,5	0,6	Perro de Presa Can	0,5	0,2	0,4	0,2	Rottweiler	0,3	0,0	1,5	0,0	Royal black	0,2	3,1	2,6	3,9	Rood dog	0,2	3,2	0,2	3,8	Golden Retriever	0,2	1,1	0,2	1,5	Malinois	0,2	0,6	0,2	0,3	Griffon	0,1	1,3	0,1	0,8	Caucasian	0,1	0,4	0,1	0,6	Alabi	0,1	0,1	0,1	0,2	American bulldog	0,1	0,0	0,1	0,0	Saluki	0,1	1,3	0,1	1,0	Balboa	0,0	0,6	0,0	0,5	Husky	0,0	0,6	0,0	0,5	<p><b>Ok it will be revised</b></p>
Breed		Infected	Healthy	Infected	Healthy																																																																																										
	Male	Male	Female	Female																																																																																											
German shepherd	0,8	0,0	0,1	0,1																																																																																											
Local	1,0	0,3	2,6	0,0																																																																																											
Lulu	0,1	0,6	2,3	0,2																																																																																											
Cross	<b>38,9</b>	0,9	0,5	0,6																																																																																											
Perro de Presa Can	0,5	0,2	0,4	0,2																																																																																											
Rottweiler	0,3	0,0	1,5	0,0																																																																																											
Royal black	0,2	3,1	2,6	3,9																																																																																											
Rood dog	0,2	3,2	0,2	3,8																																																																																											
Golden Retriever	0,2	1,1	0,2	1,5																																																																																											
Malinois	0,2	0,6	0,2	0,3																																																																																											
Griffon	0,1	1,3	0,1	0,8																																																																																											
Caucasian	0,1	0,4	0,1	0,6																																																																																											
Alabi	0,1	0,1	0,1	0,2																																																																																											
American bulldog	0,1	0,0	0,1	0,0																																																																																											
Saluki	0,1	1,3	0,1	1,0																																																																																											
Balboa	0,0	0,6	0,0	0,5																																																																																											
Husky	0,0	0,6	0,0	0,5																																																																																											