

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Case Reports in Surgery
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJCRS_97977
Title of the Manuscript:	Achalasia an unusual indication for esophagectomy case report
Type of the Article	Case report

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajcrs.com/index.php/AJCRS/editorial-policy>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>YES YES</p> <p>a) I would like to suggest mention in abstract as "treatment options for end-stage achalasia or for failure from other treatment options for achalasia like Heller's myotomy, pneumatic dilatations or POEM" instead as written by the author as "Treatment options in delayed stages like sigmoid esophagus are heller myotomy and esophagectom"</p> <p>b) Abstract should contain the purpose of the article. In this case report I would like to suggest to mention the purpose this paper as different modalities of treatment for endstage achalasia and the difficulties faced in doing esophagectomy for endstage achalsia as compared to other indications for esophagectomy. The literature mentioned that anatomy in endstage achalasia is so distorted causing more difficulty in doing esophagectomy for endstage achalasia</p> <p>c) The presence of an aberrant left hepatic artery is not related to achalasia. So this can be explained later in the discussion after writing the esophagectomy part.</p> <p>YES YES YES</p> <p>OTHER SUGGETIONS:</p> <p>1) Nowhere in this paper mentioned the POEM as one of the treatment modality in achalasia</p> <p>2) Better to mention the Patients past treatment history for achalasia.</p> <p>3) Under operative technique heading, I suggest to mention the anatomical difficulties faced while doing the esophagectomy for this patient of endstage achalasia.</p> <p>4) Management of post operative risk of anastamotic leak following esophagectomy for the endstage achalasia need more references. (The references mentioned in this paper are related to anastamotic leak following esophagectomy for other indications)</p> <p>5) Suggest writing conclusion after the end of the discussion part.</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	YES	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	Minor spellings mistakes are highlighted with red colour font.	

Review Form 1.7

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Ramalingeshwara Kantly
Department, University & Country	RGUHS, India