

## Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	<a href="#">International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_90841
Title of the Manuscript:	“Efficacy of Certain insecticides and biopesticides on percent incidence of Spotted pod borer [ <i>Maruca vitrata</i> (Geyer)] on green gram [ <i>Vigna radiata</i> (L.) Wilczek]”
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalijpss.com/index.php/IJPSS/editorial-policy> )

## Review Form 1.6

### PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p>The title is not describing the manuscript well as it does not state which insecticides or what effects the Authors wrote about. I suggest the following: Efficacy of Chlorantraniliprole 18.5 SC, Spinosad 45 SC and Emamectin benzoate insecticides and biopesticides on percent incidence of Spotted pod borer [ Maruca vitrata (Geyer)] on green gram [Vigna radiata (L.) Wilczek]</p> <p>Abstract: Please use international measures of time, so the broad readership could understand you. So instead of Karif use the months.</p> <p>To make it more readable use three times instead of thrice.</p> <p>What do you mean the larval population was taken?</p> <p>Efficacy in what? Killing the larvae or inhibiting emergence? Or inhibiting reproduction?</p> <p>What do you mean by B:C ratio? Do not use undefined abbreviations in the abstract.</p> <p>What is q/ha? Use SI values.</p> <p>The introduction is only about the mung bean. It fails to introduce the used insecticides and biopesticides, the previous results about these xenobiotics or the potential environmental consequences. Furthermore, the introduction does not present the aims of the study either.</p> <p>Methods: use the international months' name instead of Karif.</p> <p>use three times instead of the very specialized word thrice</p> <p>25 cm border is too small in case of spraying as the spray can easily spread to other subplots.</p> <p>Why is the at sign "@" before concentrations? The Si is not gm but mg, please correct it. Please define what is T1, T2 etc.</p> <p>What are these concentrations for? Are they for the active ingredient or for the whole formula? Please write them in a unified unit so they would become comparable.</p> <p>What was the initial incidence? Was it artificially set or was it naturally occurring? Were there any statistically significant differences between the plots before the experiment? Did you have an equal number of green gram plants in these small plots?</p> <p>How did you calculate cost-benefit ratio? What is the statistics you used? Did the data fulfil the assumptions? What test were used to check the assumptions?</p> <p>Use SI in the manuscript instead of quintal.</p> <p>How did you calculate incidence?</p> <p>Results and discussion: Please show the standard error too not just the means. Also, show not only the p-values but also the F-values.</p> <p>It is not right to just take the mean of different time points and make a statistical test on that number. There are models that can handle string data, so timelines too, which are suitable to this analysis.</p> <p>Overall, the manuscript does not describe the experiment, the calculations, the results or the general problem in a satisfying level. The borders between subplots are too small, which is a problem as it cannot separate the sprays properly.</p>	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>Introduction:</b></p> <p>Use a single name either use green gram or mung bean (through the manuscript).</p> <p>Throughout the manuscript: Define abbreviations before use them and define them in the table caption too.</p>	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		

### PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes. Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

### Reviewer Details:

Name:	Borbála Szabó
Department, University & Country	Centre for Ecological Research Institute of Ecology and Botany, Hungary

0