

Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Asian Research Journal of Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	Ms_ARJA_92679
Title of the Manuscript:	In-vitro biocontrol of <i>Eldana saccharina</i> Walker, a sugarcane stem borer, using essential oils from three aromatic plants
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalarja.com/index.php/ARJA/editorial-policy>)

Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)																																			
Compulsory REVISION comments																																					
Minor REVISION comments	Overall, this paper is good for journal publication.																																				
Optional/General comments	<p>1. Abstract</p> <p>a. What is the meaning of LC50 and LC90? The author didn't mention it earlier before using the short form.</p> <p>b. (P<0.001) is suggested compared to (p<.001)</p> <p>2. Introduction – Is better to send for proofreading for grammar checking.</p> <p>3. Material and methods</p> <p>a. Section 1. And 2 - Have no information. Is it the right order? Or just directly go to section 2.1?</p> <p>b. Section 2.2 - is suggested mentioning the operating condition that had been done to obtain the essential oil (temperature, time, etc). This will convince more on the extraction process since the study evaluates the use of essential oil for the treatment.</p> <p>4. Results and discussions</p> <p>a. Section 1- no detail was mentioned</p> <p>b. Recheck all the percentage value Percentage symbol is “.” Not “,”.</p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: 40px;"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">Concentration (ppm)</th> <th colspan="3">Average mortality rate (%)</th> </tr> <tr> <th>24 hours</th> <th>48 hours</th> <th>72 hours</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>10000</td> <td>100,00 d ± 0,0</td> <td>100,00 c ± 0,0</td> <td>100,00 c ± 0,0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>8000</td> <td>100,00 d ± 0,0</td> <td>100,00 c ± 0,0</td> <td>100,00 c ± 0,0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4000</td> <td>100,00 d ± 0,0</td> <td>100,00 c ± 0,0</td> <td>100,00 c ± 0,0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2000</td> <td>80,00 c ± 20,00</td> <td>93,33 c ± 11,5</td> <td>93,33 c ± 11,5</td> </tr> <tr> <td>1000</td> <td>33,33 b ± 11,5</td> <td>53,33 b ± 41,6</td> <td>56,67 b ± 37,9</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Control</td> <td>0,00 a ± 0,0</td> <td>0,00 a ± 0,0</td> <td>0,00 a ± 0,0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Significance (P)</td> <td colspan="3">0,00 ***</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>c. Table 5- please mention the units and recheck the percentage of decimal point</p> <p>d. It suggested adding more to the recommendation in the discussion/conclusion to give an idea of how this study can be expanded/ further explore by the author.</p>	Concentration (ppm)	Average mortality rate (%)			24 hours	48 hours	72 hours	10000	100,00 d ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	8000	100,00 d ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	4000	100,00 d ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	2000	80,00 c ± 20,00	93,33 c ± 11,5	93,33 c ± 11,5	1000	33,33 b ± 11,5	53,33 b ± 41,6	56,67 b ± 37,9	Control	0,00 a ± 0,0	0,00 a ± 0,0	0,00 a ± 0,0	Significance (P)	0,00 ***			
Concentration (ppm)	Average mortality rate (%)																																				
	24 hours	48 hours	72 hours																																		
10000	100,00 d ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0																																		
8000	100,00 d ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0																																		
4000	100,00 d ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0	100,00 c ± 0,0																																		
2000	80,00 c ± 20,00	93,33 c ± 11,5	93,33 c ± 11,5																																		
1000	33,33 b ± 11,5	53,33 b ± 41,6	56,67 b ± 37,9																																		
Control	0,00 a ± 0,0	0,00 a ± 0,0	0,00 a ± 0,0																																		
Significance (P)	0,00 ***																																				

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Review Form 1.6

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Asdarina Binti Yahya
Department, University & Country	School of Chemical Engineering, College of Engineering, Universiti Teknologi MARA, Malaysia