

Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_93555
Title of the Manuscript:	Castor seed oil: a promising biomitecide for sustainable management of the red coffee mite (<i>Oligonychus ilicis</i>) (McGregor, 1917) (Prostigmata: Tetranychidae)
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journaljeai.com/index.php/JEAI/editorial-policy>)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	<p>In relation to the request to review the manuscript "Castor seed oil: promising biomitecide for sustainable management of the red coffee mite <i>Oligonychus ilicis</i>", I have the following considerations:</p> <p>Bioassays Castor seed oil was tested at concentrations of 0.5, 1.0, 1.5, 2.0, 2.5 and 3.0% (v/v) on eggs, larvae, nymphs (protonymphs and deutonymphs), and adults obtained as described above. Eight replicates per treatment were performed, with 12 individuals per repetition. Each experimental unit consisted of a Petri dish (10.0 x 1.2 cm) lined with cotton inside. On top of the cotton, 4 cm diameter coffee leaf discs were added, with cotton moistened around them to maintain the turgidity of the leaf and prevent the escape of mites</p> <p>Treatments of <i>O. ilicis</i> eggs with castor seed oil at concentrations of 0.5, 1.0, 1.5, 2.0, and 2.5 and 3% (v/v) showed hatching of 74.2, 67.6, 53.1, 41.7, and 29.3%, respectively, while the control treatment showed 79.1% hatching (Figure 2).</p> <p>Based on these results they conclude:</p> <p>CONCLUSIONS</p> <p>The plant-based castor seed oil is ecologically correct and has a natural pesticide action. From this study, it can be concluded that castor seed oil can be used as a safe and effective alternative to control the red coffee mite due to its high efficiency against eggs, larvae, nymphs and adults of <i>O. ilicis</i>.</p> <p>I do not agree with these conclusions, since what the authors are presenting is a laboratory study, testing the effect of castor seeds oil on the mite <i>Oligonychus ilicis</i>. These results cannot be transported to field conditions, where conditions are quite different to the laboratory assay.</p> <p>My conclusion is not to approve this manuscript for publication in the way conclusions are presented. To admit this conclusion, field research in coffee plantations should be executed to determine under these conditions</p>	
Minor REVISION comments		
Optional/General comments		

Review Form 1.6

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Alex Enrique Bustillo Pardey
Department, University & Country	National Research Center for Oil Palm, Colombia