



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJTDH_44019
Title of the Manuscript:	Rain Season Malaria Parasite Transmission and Asymptomatic Malaria among Northeastern Nigerian Nomads
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



[SDI Review Form 1.6](#)

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p>	<p>Title: change the title into “<i>Malaria transmission and asymptomatic malaria during rainy season among Nomads, Nigeria</i>”</p> <p>Abstract: Reformulate a few sentences of the abstract. For example, you can short the sentence about the prevalence of asymptomatic malaria.</p> <p>Introduction:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ It is well written. However, you have to update certain references as for instance references on the World malaria report. ✓ Did you collect your data in 2006 or 2016? Indeed, you specified 2006 in the line 56 and 2016 in the abstract. <p>Material:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Lines 57-70: Add some epidemiological data on malaria transmission in your study area. What is the infective entomological rate (EIR) in these areas for instance? The study area is hyperendemic, holoendemic? This information can allow for understanding results you found. ✓ Line 76: which method did you use to randomly select the camps (i.e., random numbers tables, <i>in silico</i>-generated random method for instance)? ✓ Lines 86-87: Specify which medicines and preventive barriers were used by the nomads. These can allow for better understanding your findings as regards the association between malaria and these both variables. ✓ Line 122-127: Add the ID number of the ethical clearance ✓ How did you define the asymptomatic malaria? Give the formal definition you have used and of course with reference ✓ How did you deal with uninfected persons but presenting symptoms such as fever? You have to specify it within the Ethical considerations as there are some ethical issues. <p>Results: Specify the mean age and the median age</p> <p>Table 1:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Change “Demographic characteristics and infection status of participants” to “Variables” ▪ Change “In percentage” to “Percentage” ▪ The sum of percentage for two variables, namely Age group and Malaria 	



	<p>infection status, do not give 100% but rather 99.9%</p> <p>What were the symptoms reported in your study? Present them in a Figure</p> <p>Table 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ You have to present two chi-square values. The first for association between malaria infection status (infected and uninfected) and symptomatology. The second for association between infection intensity and symptomatology.▪ The sum of percentage does not give 100% for individuals whose parasite density was moderate (51.3% AND 48.6%) <p>You have to compute the size of effect for depicting relationship between symptomatology and variables collected using questionnaire (use logistic regression)</p> <p>Present results the association between mean values of parasitemia and different variables</p> <p>Give the overall value of asymptomatic malaria prevalence with a confidence interval at 95% (95%CI)</p> <p>Discussion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">✓ Line 192: change reference 24 and 25 as the corresponding studies were carried in Asia and South America. There are more recent African studies who also found a high asymptomatic malaria prevalence such as Lehman <i>et al.</i> (2018) or Kamgain <i>et al.</i> (2017) in Cameroon. You can find more studies from other settings and countries such as Congo, Chad for instance.✓ Line 194: you said “.....the risk of experiencing fever symptoms.....”<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ So, you did not have quantify the risk in your study. Thus, you have to compute the relative risk (RR) using Logistic regression models as mentioned above.▪ In addition, there are no results on “fever symptoms” in the RESULTS section of your manuscript. That’s why I asked you to well specified which symptoms were looked for and reported in the study.✓ Lines 199-201:<ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ Bacterial infections can also be responsible for symptoms even though the absence of malaria parasites. That’s why it is important you specify which	
--	---	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

	<p>symptoms you reported during the study.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">▪ You have also to outline the potential effect of confounders such as age or gender that could have modulate the association between symptomatology and infection intensity. So, it would be interesting to check out this assumption by doing deeper statistical analysis. Indeed, I think you did not have sufficiently exploited your data.▪ Besides, you have to outline the fact thick blood smear can elicit false negative results given the numerous limitations of the technique (many authors reported this). <p>✓ Line 212: you said “.....<i>their most recent fever episode.....</i>” So, in others sections of the manuscript you used the term “febrile symptoms” (line 199) or “manifestation of symptoms” (line 146). It is confusing! Please, standardize it!!!!</p> <p>✓ You have to give some limits of your study</p> <p>References:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">✓ Add recent references as your latest reference was published in 2015✓ Standardize the references accordance to the guidelines of the journal (IJTDH). In certain references, the name of journal is written in entire while for others the abbreviation is given. The same observation is made for page number. <p>Ethical Issue:</p> <p>The authors have to specify how they dealt with malaria uninfected individuals but however presenting clinical symptoms.</p>	
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p>	<p>Material and Methods</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Line 81: Delete “also” ✓ Line 117: specify the reference of the software (i.e., SPSS) you used for statistical analysis <p>Results</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ✓ Line 133: change “participant” to “participants” ✓ Change “sex” to “Gender” within all written sections and tables of the paper ✓ ✓ <p>Line 304: Is a reference?</p> <p>The authors have to correct many aspects of their study especially methodological and ethical aspects.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>This paper is interesting and very helpful for defining control strategies of malaria. This paper can be greatly improved if the authors take into account the recommendations of referees.</p>	

PART 2:

	<p>Reviewer’s comment</p>	<p>Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p>
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

<p>Name:</p>	<p>Kojom Foko Loick Pradel</p>
<p>Department, University & Country</p>	<p>The University of Douala, Cameroon</p>