

EFFICACY OF NEW HERBICIDE MIXTURES ON WEED CONTROL, YIELD, AND ECONOMICS IN TRANSPLANTED RICE

ABSTRACT

Aim: To evaluate the efficacy of new herbicide mixtures on the weed control and performance of transplanted rice.

Study Design: Randomized Complete Block Design.

Place and duration of study: All India Coordinated Research Project on Weed Management, PJTSAU, Hyderabad between August to December, 2021.

Methodology: The efficacy of herbicide mixtures either ready mix or as tank mixtures were evaluated for effective and broad spectrum weed control in transplanted rice during *kharif* season, 2021 at AICRP on Weed Management, PJTSAU, Rajendranagar, Hyderabad. The experiment was laid out in a randomized block design with nine treatments and three replications. The treatments included five ready mix-mixes (RM) one tank mix combination of new herbicides tested against one single herbicide, weedy check, and hand weeding twice at 20 and 40 DAT.

Results: The results of the study revealed that bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹ + penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) (tank mix) as ~~post-emergence~~ ~~post-emergence~~ (POE) *fb* hand weeding (HW) at 40 DAT or penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) @ 820 g ha⁻¹ (RM) as POE *fb* HW at 40 DAT or penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) (RM) as POE *fb* HW at 40 DAT or bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) GR (RM) as pre-emergence (PE) *fb* HW at 40 DAT were equally effective to hand weeding twice at 20 and 40 DAT with respect to suppression of weeds at 60 DAT. The yield attributes like a number of tillers/m², panicles no, panicle length, grains panicle⁻¹, and test weight were found to be higher with penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as POE *fb* HW at 40 DAT which also recorded higher grain yield, straw yield, gross returns, net returns, and B-C ratio but it was found to be on par with other herbicide combinations.

Conclusion: It can be concluded that new herbicide mixtures either as ready mix or tank mix performed better than sole application or hand weeding alone.

Keywords: B-C ratio, Herbicide mixtures, Rice, ~~Weed~~ ~~weed~~ dry weight, Yield.

Formatted: Not Superscript/ Subscript

Formatted: Font: Not Bold

Formatted: Font: Not Bold

1. INTRODUCTION

Among the cereals, rice is the most important and extensively grown in tropical and subtropical regions of the world and is a staple food for more than 60 ~~per cent~~percent of the ~~world-world's~~ population (Yaduraju and Rao, 2019). In India rice is grown over a 42.4 M ha area with a production of 104.4 M tons and productivity of 2.46 tons ha⁻¹ (Teja *et al.*, 2015). Rice production needs to be increased by 50 % or more above the current production level to meet the rising food demand (Sunyobet *et al.*, 2015). Weed infestation and interference is a serious problem in rice fields that significantly decreases the yield (Mamun, 1990). According to Mahbub and Bhuiyan (2019), the losses due to the infestation of the weeds are greater than the combined losses caused by ~~insect~~insects, ~~pest~~pests, and diseases in rice. Weeds not only cause huge reductions in rice yields but also increase the cost of cultivation, reduce input efficiency, interfere with agricultural operations, impair the quality and act as alternate hosts for several insect pests, and diseases. Weeds compete for nutrients, space, and sunlight and consume the available soil moisture with crop plants resulting in crop yield reduction. Weed management in rice production is a major constraint and is expensive. Since hand weeding and other weed control measures are laborious and time consuming~~time-consuming~~, chemicals are the obvious and ~~cost-effective~~cost-effective weed control practices (Jayadeva, 2010).

Chemical weed control has become popular in India due to the scarcity of ~~labour~~labor during peak growing ~~season~~seasons and lower ~~weeding~~wedding~~cost~~costs. Especially at the time of peak ~~period~~periods of ~~labour~~labor crisis sometimes weeding becomes late causing drastic losses in grain yield (FAO, 2004). Nowadays the use of herbicides is gaining popularity in rice culture due to their rapid effects and less cost involvement compared to traditional methods. Quite a lot of pre and ~~post-emergence~~post-emergence herbicides such as butachlor, pretilachlor, oxadiazon, pyrazosulfuron ethyl, ethoxysulfuron, bispyribac sodium alone or supplemented with ~~one-hand~~one-hand weeding ~~have~~has been found to be useful for weed control in transplanted rice. ~~Use~~The use of a single herbicide might often ~~leads~~lead to the control of only a particular group of weeds. ~~So~~So, to give farmers a wide choice of effective herbicides ~~along with~~along with ~~broad spectrum~~broad spectrum weed control, there is a need to evaluate the mixtures (either ready mix or tank mix) of herbicide molecules of newer chemistries with ~~different modes~~different mode of action. Hence, the present study was therefore planned to evaluate the efficacy of different herbicide mixtures for weed suppression and ~~its~~their impact on transplanted rice.

2. MATERIAL AND METHODS

A field experiment was conducted during *kharif*, 2021 at All India Coordinated Research Project on Weed Management, Professor Jayashankar Telangana State Agricultural University, Rajendranagar, Hyderabad with nine treatments laid out in randomized block design with three replications. The soil of the experimental site was sandy clay loam in texture. Treatments included nine herbicide combinations; T₁: Penoxsulam 1.02%

(20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) (RM) as post emergence ~~fb~~ hand weeding at 40 DAT, T₂: Penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) @ 820 g ha⁻¹(RM)as post-emergence ~~fb~~ hand weeding at 40 DAT, T₃: Pyrazosulfuronethyl 0.15 % (15 g ha⁻¹)+ pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) (RM) as pre-emergence ~~fb~~ hand weeding at 40 DAT, T₄: Bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) GR (RM) as pre-emergence ~~fb~~ hand weeding at 40 DAT, T₅: Bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹ as post emergence ~~fb~~ hand weeding at 40 DAT, T₆: Triafamone 20% (44 g ha⁻¹) +ethoxysulfuron 10% WG (22.5 g ha⁻¹) (RM) as post- emergence ~~fb~~ hand weeding at 40 DAT, T₇: Bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹+penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) (tank mix) as post- emergence ~~fb~~ hand weeding at 40 DAT, T₈: Hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT andT₉: Unweeded control. Rice variety 'Telangana Sona (RNR 15048)'was used for the experiment. ~~Nursery~~~~The nursery~~was sown on 2nd August, 2021. ~~Land~~~~The land~~was prepared by ploughing followed by through puddling. Seedlings of 25 days ~~of~~ age were transplanted on 27th August, 2021 at ~~a~~ spacing of 15 cm x 10 cm. ~~Recommended~~~~The recommended~~dose of fertilizer i.e., 120:60:40 kg N: P₂O₅: K₂O as urea, single super phosphate, and muriate of potash was applied. The entire P₂O₅ and half of K₂O were applied at sowing. Nitrogen was applied in three equal splits (1/3rd each at basal, maximum ~~tiller~~~~tillering~~, and panicle initiation). ~~The~~ Gross plot size was 5.8m x 3.8m. Data on weed count and weed dry weight were taken from each plot on 30 and 60 DAT. The weeds were identified species-wise. Dry weights of weeds were taken from each plot by shade drying initially followed by oven drying at ~~60°C~~~~60°C~~ to a constant weight and expressed in g m⁻². Data on plant height, number of tillers at harvest, panicles m⁻², panicle length, test weight, grains per panicle, grain yield, and straw yield were collected. Gross returns, net returns, and B-C ratio ~~was~~~~were~~calculated for each treatment and analyzed statistically.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Weed control

3.1.1 Weed density

Weed density was recorded at 30 and 60 DAT. Results showed significant differences among the herbicidal treatments for the weed count of grass, sedge and broad leaf species. Maximum weed density was recorded in unweeded control (T₉) at 30 and 60 DAT (Table 1). The data showed that hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT (T₈) ~~was better result in better~~ ~~resulted in~~controlling both monocot and dicot weeds at 30 DAT while at 60 DAT, ~~the~~ maximum reduction in weed count was observed with bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹ as ~~post-emergence~~~~post-emergence~~~~fb~~ hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₅) which was found to be on par with all other treatments and significantly superior over unweeded control. The results are in line with Teja *et al.* (2015) who found that bensulfuron methyl 0.6% + pretilachlor 6% registered ~~a~~ lower number as well as dry weight of grassy, broadleaved, sedge, and total weeds at 45 DAT.

3.1.2 Weed Dry Weight

The highest weed dry weight was recorded in unweeded control (T_9) at 30 and 60 DAT that received practically no weed control measures (Table 2). Herbicidal weed control treatments significantly affected all categories of weeds (grass, sedges, and broad-leaved) and the lowest weed dry weight was recorded in the plots that received bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha^{-1}) + pretilachlor 6% (600 g ha^{-1}) GR as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T_4). It was on par with triafamone 20% (44 g ha^{-1}) + ethoxysulfuron 10% WG (22.5 g ha^{-1}) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T_6), hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT (T_8) and penoxsulam 1.02% (20 g ha^{-1}) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha^{-1}) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T_4). At 60 DAT, hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT (T_8) recorded lowest weed dry weight probably due to effective control of first flush of weeds from 15-45 DAT but penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha^{-1}) + butachlor (38.8%) @ 820 g ha^{-1} as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T_2), bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha^{-1} + penoxsulam 1.02% (20 g ha^{-1}) (tank mix) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T_7), penoxsulam 1.02% (20 g ha^{-1}) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha^{-1}) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T_1) and bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha^{-1}) + pretilachlor 6% (600 g ha^{-1}) GR as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T_4) were also on par with hand weeding twice. Nazir *et al.* (2022) also evaluated Butachlor @ $1500 \text{ g a.i ha}^{-1}$; Penoxsulam @ $22.5 \text{ g a.i ha}^{-1}$; Pyrazosulfuron ethyl + pretilachlor @ 15 and $600 \text{ g a.i ha}^{-1}$; Bensulfuron methyl + pretilachlor @ 60 and $600 \text{ g a.i ha}^{-1}$ in transplanted rice at Wadora-Sopore, J&K. They found that all herbicides considerably reduced dry weed biomass, but penoxsulam herbicide showed the greatest reduction in dry weed biomass and proved superior against complex weed flora.

Formatted: English (United States)

Formatted: English (United States)

Formatted: English (United States)

Table 1: Total weed density (No./m^2) and Weed dry weight (g/m^2) in transplanted rice as influenced by herbicides and herbicide mixtures

Treatment		Total weed count (No./m^2)		Total Weed dry weight (g/m^2)	
		30 DAT	60 DAT	30 DAT	60 DAT
T_1	Penoxsulam 1.02% (20 g ha^{-1}) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha^{-1}) (RM) as post emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	4.65 (20.67)	2.14 (3.67)	4.19 (16.67)	2.92 (7.60)
T_2	Penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha^{-1}) + butachlor (38.8%) 820 g ha^{-1} (RM) as post-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	4.58 (20.00)	2.40 (4.67)	4.50 (19.33)	2.72 (6.67)
T_3	Pyrazosulfuron ethyl 0.15 % (15 g ha^{-1}) + pretilachlor 6% (600 g ha^{-1}) (RM) as pre-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40	4.57 (20.00)	2.28 (4.33)	5.45 (29.00)	3.32 (10.33)

	DAT				
T ₄	Bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha ⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600 g ha ⁻¹) GR (RM) as pre-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	3.59 (12.00)	2.29 (4.33)	3.89 (14.33)	3.09 (8.70)
T ₅	Bispyribac sodium 10% sc 25 g ha ⁻¹ as post emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	4.54 (19.67)	1.99 (3.33)	5.16 (25.67)	3.34 (10.20)
T ₆	Triafamone 20% (44 g ha ⁻¹) + ethoxysulfuron 10% WG (22.5 g ha ⁻¹) (RM) as post- emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	4.96 (23.67)	2.14 (3.67)	3.97 (15.00)	3.40 (10.73)
T ₇	Bispyribac sodium 10% sc 25 g ha ⁻¹ + penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha ⁻¹) (tank mix) as post- emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	5.75 (32.33)	2.00 (3.00)	4.46 (19.00)	2.78 (6.73)
T ₈	Hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT	2.87 (7.33)	2.14 (3.67)	4.00 (15.00)	2.48 (5.27)
T ₉	Unweeded control	9.06 (81.33)	9.65 (92.33)	7.92 (62.00)	10.45 (108.33)
	SE(m)±	0.232	0.253	0.269	0.268
	CD (P=.05)	0.700	0.766	0.815	0.811

3.2 Crop Growth and Yield Attributes

3.2.1 Plant Height

The herbicide mixtures or hand weeding did not show any significant influence on the plant height of rice at harvest (Table 3).

3.2.2 Number of Tillers m⁻²

Higher number of tillers m⁻² was registered with penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as ~~post-emergence~~ post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) which was on par with triafamone 20% (44 g ha⁻¹) + ethoxysulfuron 10% WG (22.5 g ha⁻¹) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₆), bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹ + penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) (tank mix) as post- emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₇), penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) @ 820 g ha⁻¹ as post- emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₂) and bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) GR as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₄) while the lower number of tillers m⁻² was obtained with unweeded control (T₉) (Table 2).

3.2.3 Number of Panicles m⁻²

Similar tonumber of tillers m⁻², the number of panicles m⁻² was also higher with penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) (Table 2). It was found to be on par with bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹ + penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) (tank mix) as post- emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₇), bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) GR as pre-

Formatted: English (United States)

emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₄) and pyrazosulfuronethyl 0.15 % (15 g ha⁻¹)+ pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₃). Unweeded control (T₉) recorded the lower number of panicles m².

3.2.4 Panicle Length

Among the treatments, the maximum panicle length was observed with pyrazosulfuronethyl 0.15 % (15 g ha⁻¹)+ pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₃) which was on par with bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) GR as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₄), hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT (T₈), bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹+penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) (tank mix) as post- emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₇), penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) and penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) @ 820 g ha⁻¹as post- emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₂).The lower panicle length was recorded with unweeded control (T₉).

Formatted: English (United States)

3.2.5 Grains Panicle⁻¹

It is revealed from the data in Table 3 that a higher number of grains per panicle was significantly affected by the herbicides and their combinations. Among the various treatments, the higher number of grains per panicle was recorded with penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) and was in equivalence with pyrazosulfuronethyl 0.15 % (15 g ha⁻¹)+ pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₃), bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹ as post emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₅), bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) GR as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₄), bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹+penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) (tank mix) as post- emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₇), penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) @ 820 g ha⁻¹as post- emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₂) and triafamone 20% (44 g ha⁻¹) + ethoxysulfuron 10% WG (22.5 g ha⁻¹)as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₆).

Formatted: English (United States)

3.2.6 Test Weight

Perusal of the data in Table 2 shows that penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) produced a higher test weight than unweeded control (T₉). However, this result was comparable to T₂, T₃, T₆, T₈, and T₄ treatments.

Formatted: English (United States)

Table 2: Yield attributes in transplanted rice as influenced by herbicides and herbicide mixtures

Treatment	Plant height at	Tillers at harve	No. of panicle s/m ²	Panicle length (cm)	No. of grains/ panicle	Test weight (g)
-----------	-----------------	------------------	---------------------------------	---------------------	------------------------	-----------------

		harvest (cm)	st (No/ m ²)				
T ₁	Penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha ⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha ⁻¹) (RM) as post emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	71.41	257	218	16.11	162	13.67
T ₂	Penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha ⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) 820 g ha ⁻¹ (RM)as post- emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	68.59	223	188	15.97	143	13.57
T ₃	Pyrazosulfuronethyl 0.15 % (15 g ha ⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha ⁻¹) (RM) as pre-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	74.23	207	195	17.48	155	13.43
T ₄	Bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha ⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha ⁻¹) GR (RM) as pre-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT.	70.67	218	196	16.62	151	13.10
T ₅	Bispyribac sodium 10% sc 25 g ha ⁻¹ as post emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	71.82	210	191	15.20	153	12.90
T ₆	Triafamone 20% (44 g ha ⁻¹) + ethyxsulfuron 10% WG (22.5 g ha ⁻¹) (RM) as post-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	71.20	227	195	15.86	140	13.37
T ₇	Bispyribac sodium 10% sc 25 g ha ⁻¹ +penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha ⁻¹) (tank mix) as post- emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	68.61	225	198	16.22	144	12.90
T ₈	Hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT	72.65	182	161	16.50	109	13.23
T ₉	Unweeded control	75.83	134	88	12.59	83	11.77
	SE(m)±	1.982	13.75	7.45	0.57	7.96	0.25
	CD (P=.05)	NS	41.59	22.62	1.74	24.07	0.76

3.3 Yield

3.3.1 Grain Yield

A critical look at the data indicates that the grain yield of rice was influenced significantly due to the different herbicides alone or in combination (Table 3). Rice grain yield was significantly higher with penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as ~~post-emergence~~ ~~post-emergence~~ *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) which was similar with the rest of the herbicide treatments tested during *kharif*, 2021. This might be due to the higher crop growth of rice due to lower weed competition. This resulted in large amounts of photosynthates accumulation leading to better yield attributes, finally higher yield. The yield

Formatted: English (United States)

of rice also depends on partitioning ability of photosynthates from source to sink *i.e.*, developing grains which leads to increased yield. All the yield promoting characters were significantly higher with penoxsulam 1.02% (20 g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) due to better partitioning of photosynthates to developing grains. The lower grain yield was registered under unweeded control (T₉). Similar results were obtained by Chaudhary *et al.* (2020) who observed increased grain yield of transplanted rice with the application of pretilachlor (750 g a.i.ha⁻¹) at 3 DAT + penoxulam (22 g a.i.ha⁻¹) at 20 DAT.

3.3.2 Straw yield

It is apparent from the data that herbicide treatments have shown a significant impact on straw yield (Table 3). The highest straw yield was achieved with the application of penoxsulam 1.02% (20 g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁), however, unweeded control (T₉) recorded the lower straw yield in rice. Post-emergence application of herbicides augmented the growth, and improved the yield structure thereby yield of rice which might be due to reduced competition from weeds for a prolonged period of crop growth. These results are in line with Rao *et al.* (2021) who reported that without the application of post-emergence herbicides, the rice yield may reduce by 9 to 60 %.

3.3.3 Harvest Index

Statistical analysis of data shows that there was a significant effect of herbicide treatments on the harvest index of *kharif* rice crop and which is presented in Table 3. The treatment bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹) GR as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₄) recorded the highest harvest index which was on par with rest of the treatments while unweeded control recorded the lowest harvest index (T₉).

3.4 Economics

3.4.1 Gross Returns

With the application of penoxsulam 1.02% (20 g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁), higher gross returns were noticed which was similar with other herbicidal treatments and hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT (Table 3). The unweeded control (T₉) recorded lower gross returns.

3.4.2 Net Returns

When compared to other herbicide combinations, penoxsulam 1.02% (20 g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) considerably increased the monetary returns of rice and was found to be on par with bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹ as post emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₅), triafamone 20% (44 g ha⁻¹) + ethoxysulfuron 10% WG (22.5 g ha⁻¹) as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₆), penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) @ 820 g ha⁻¹ as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₂) and bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha⁻¹)

Formatted: English (United States)

Formatted: English (United States)

GR as pre-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₄) as shown in Table 3. Lower monetary returns were seen in unweeded control (T₉).

3.4.3 B-C ratio

Penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) as post emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT (T₁) gave maximum B-C ratio while the lower B-C ratio was observed with unweeded control (T₉) (Table 3). The next best herbicidal treatment was bispyribac sodium 10% sc 25 g ha⁻¹ as [post-emergence](#) *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT and penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) @ 820 g ha⁻¹ as post-emergence *fb* hand weeding at 40 DAT.

Table 3: Yield and economics in transplanted rice as influenced by herbicides and herbicide mixtures

Treatment		Grain yield (Kg/ha)	Straw yield (kg/ha)	HI	COC	GR	NR	B-C ratio
T ₁	Penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha ⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha ⁻¹) (RM) as post emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	5596	6710	45.4	65745	123107	57362	1.87
T ₂	Penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha ⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) 820 g ha ⁻¹ (RM) as post-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	5403	5981	47.4	64750	117861	53111	1.82
T ₃	Pyrazosulfuronethyl 0.15 % (15 g ha ⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha ⁻¹) (RM) as pre-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	5261	6413	45.0	65250	115949	50699	1.78
T ₄	Bensulfuron methyl 0.6 % (60 g ha ⁻¹) + pretilachlor 6% (600g ha ⁻¹) GR (RM) as pre-emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	5436	5803	48.3	65375	118158	52783	1.81
T ₅	Bispyribac sodium 10% sc 25 g ha ⁻¹ as post	5463	6475	45.7	64750	120025	55275	1.85

	emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT							
T ₆	Triafamone 20% (44 g ha ⁻¹) +Ethyxysulfuron 10% WG (22.5 g ha ⁻¹) (RM) as post- emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	5490	6237	46.8	66750	120070	53321	1.80
T ₇	Bispyribac sodium 10% sc 25 g ha ⁻¹ +Penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha ⁻¹) (tank mix) as post- emergence <i>fb</i> hand weeding at 40 DAT	5448	6120	47.0	68500	119013	50513	1.74
T ₈	Hand weeding at 20 and 40 DAT	5146	6594	43.8	68500	114043	45544	1.66
T ₉	Unweeded control	1066	2270	31.9	64750	25440	-39310	0.39
	SE(m)±	233	206	0.8	-	4887	4887	0.07
	CD (P=.05)	706	622	2.4	-	14778	14779	0.22

The manuscript has a poor scientific quality related to the discussion of the results; therefore, I suggest that the authors increase the scientific quality by discussing the results with scientific research already published. I suggest adding a couple of paragraphs like this:

Our results establish that weed control is key in the development of this crop, as established by the results of (Olivares and Hernandez, 2020; Olivares et al. 2020) in tropical zones comparable to our study area. Historically, Varanasi is a humid area and has a predominantly hot climate, however, the monthly average precipitation has varied over the years, with a decrease in precipitation in the summer, this can be evidenced in the results of (Olivares and Hernandez, 2019a; 2019b; Casana and Olivares, 2020; Bertorelli and Olivares, 2020). It is important to point out that the poor soil moisture condition causes delays in the growth of wheat and other types of crops such as winter cereals and even in tropical territories, it delays sowing, as established by studies of (Olivares et al. 2013; Olivares and Zingaretti, 2018; 2019). The water potentials that occur in soils during periods of drought prevent water absorption (Olivares et al. 2017; Cortez et al. 2019; Olivares 2016; Olivares et al. 2018a), affecting the sequence of events involved in the seed germination process (Olivares et al. 2018b; Olivares, 2018; Cortez et al. 2018). In summary, water stress, weed control and nitrogen fertilization associated with sowing dates is, in terms of the amount of plant matter affected, the most important thing that this type of

Formatted: Justified, Line spacing: 1.5 lines

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Line spacing: 1.5 lines

crop such as wheat can suffer. In this sense, investigations carried out in tropical territories such as (Cortez et al. 2016; Paredes and Olivares, 2018; Olivares et al. 2017a) have indicated that the stress caused by drought limits the productivity of these plants and that the intensity of their response depends on the severity and duration of the stress, and the state of crop development. That is why the search for planting dates and varieties tolerant to water stress is one of the ways considered by researchers and producers for the use of areas where droughts are frequent or the necessary water supply is not available (Olivares et al. 2016; Olivares et al. 2017b).

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 10 pt

Formatted: Font: 10 pt

CONCLUSION

This experiment has shown that penoxsulam 1.02% (20g ha⁻¹) + cyhalofop butyl 5.1% (100 g ha⁻¹) (RM) as ~~post-emergence~~ post-emergence fb hand weeding at 40 DAT increased the growth, yield components, yield and monetary returns of transplanted rice with reduced weed density and weed dry weight but closely followed by bispyribac sodium 10% SC 25 g ha⁻¹ as post emergence fb hand weeding at 40 DAT and penoxsulam 0.97% (20 g ha⁻¹) + butachlor (38.8%) 820 g ha⁻¹ (RM) as post-emergence fb hand weeding at 40 DAT.

REFERENCES:

I suggest adding the following scientific publications that will improve the scientific quality of the manuscript.

Formatted: Highlight

Chaudhary P, Vivek, Naresh RK, Dhyani BP, Sharath M. Effect of weed management practices on weed dynamics, nutrient uptake, productivity and profitability of transplanted rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). Journal of Pharmacognosy and Phytochemistry. 2020;9(5): 2764-2772.

FAO, Production Year Book. Food and agriculture production functions, Iowa state University Press, Ames, IOWA, USA. 2004; 63: 105-229.

Jayadeva HM. Bioefficacy of post emergence herbicides in weed management of transplanted rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). Journal of Crop and Weed. 2010;6(2): 3-66.

Mahbu MM, Bhuiyan MKA. Performance of quinclorac + fenoxyprop-P-ethyl + pyrazosulfuron-ethyl 70% WP against annual weeds of transplanted rice. America Eurasian Journal of Agriculture and Environmental Sciences. 2019;19(6): 439-447.

Mamun AA. Weeds and their control: A review of weed research in Bangladesh. Agricultural and rural development in Bangladesh. Japan International Co-operation Agency, Dhaka, Bangladesh. JSARD. 1990;19: 45-72.

Nazir A, Bhat MA, Bhat TA, Fayaz S, Mir MS, Basu U, et al. Comparative Analysis of Rice and Weeds and Their Nutrient Partitioning under Various Establishment Methods and Weed Management Practices in Temperate Environment. Agronomy 2022; 12, 816. <https://doi.org/10.3390/agronomy 12040816>.

Rao AU, Kumar KM, Visalakashmi V, Rao SG. Influence of post emergence application of herbicides on growth, yield and economics of dry direct sown rice. *International Journal of Environment and Climate Change*. 2021;11(12): 158-164.

Sunyob NB, Juraim MA, Hakim A, Man A, Alam MA. Competitive ability of some selected rice varieties against weed under aerobic conditions. *International Journal of Agriculture and Biology*. 2015;17:61-70.

Teja KC, Duary B, Bhowmik MK. Efficacy of herbicides on weed management in wet season transplanted rice. *Journal of Crop and Weed*. 2015;11: 224-227.

Yaduraju NT, Rao AN. Implications of weeds and weed management on food security and safety in the Asia-Pacific region. Proc. 24th APWSS Conf. 22-25 October, 2013, Bandung, Indonesia, pp.13-30.

[Olivares B, Hernández R. Application of multivariate techniques in the agricultural land's aptitude in Carabobo, Venezuela. *Tropical and Subtropical Agroecosystems*. 2020; 23\(2\):1-12. Doi: <https://n9.cl/zeedh>](#)

[Olivares B, Hernandez R, Arias A, Molina JC, Pereira Y. Eco-territorial adaptability of tomato crops for sustainable agricultural production in Carabobo, Venezuela. *Idesia*. 2020; 38\(2\):95-102. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4067/S0718-34292020000200095>](#)

[Olivares B, Hernández R. Ecoterritorial sectorization for the sustainable agricultural production of potato \(*Solanum tuberosum* L.\) in Carabobo, Venezuela. *Agricultural Science and Technology*. 2019b; 20\(2\): 339-354. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.21930/rcta.vol20num2art:1462>](#)

[Olivares B, Hernández R. Análisis regional de zonas homogéneas de precipitación en Carabobo, Venezuela. *Revista Lasallista de Investigación*. 2019a; 16\(2\):90-105. Doi: \[10.22507/rli.v16n2a9\]\(https://doi.org/10.22507/rli.v16n2a9\)](#)

[Casana S, Olivares B. Evolution and trend of surface temperature and windspeed \(1994 - 2014\) at the Parque Nacional Doñana, Spain. *Rev. Fac. Agron. \(LUZ\)*. 2020; 37\(1\):1-25. Doi: <https://n9.cl/xkfb>](#)

[Bortorelli M, Olivares BO. Population fluctuation of *Spodoptera frugiperda* \(J.E. Smith\) \(Lepidoptera: Noctuidae\) in sorghum cultivation in Southern Anzoátegui, Venezuela. *Journal of Agriculture University of Puerto Rico*. 2020; 104\(1\):1-16. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.46429/jaupr.v104i1.18283>](#)

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 11 pt

[Olivares B, Torrealba J, Caraballo L. Variability of the precipitation regime in the period 1990-2009 in the location of El Tigre, Anzoátegui state, Venezuela. Rev. Fac. Agron. \(LUZ\). 2013; 30 \(1\): 19-32. Doi: <https://n9.cl/mic0l>](#)

[Olivares B, Zingaretti ML. Application of multivariate methods for the characterization of meteorological drought periods in Venezuela. Revista Luna Azul. 2019; 48, 172:192. Doi: \[10.17151/luaz.2019.48.10\]\(https://doi.org/10.17151/luaz.2019.48.10\)](#)

[Olivares B, Zingaretti ML. Análisis de la sequía meteorológica en cuatro localidades agrícolas de Venezuela mediante la combinación de métodos multivariados. UNED Research Journal. 2018; 10 \(1\):181-192. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.22458/urj.v10i1.2026>](#)

[Olivares B, Cortez A, Parra R, Lobo D, Rodríguez MF, Rey JC. Evaluation of agricultural vulnerability to drought weather in different locations of Venezuela. Rev. Fac. Agron. \(LUZ\). 2017; 34 \(1\): 103-129. Doi: <https://n9.cl/hc5xs>](#)

[Cortez A, Olivares B, Parra M, Lobo D, Rey JC, Rodríguez MF. Systematization of the calculation of the Standardized Precipitation Index as a methodology to generate meteorological drought information. Rev. Fac. Agron. \(LUZ\). 2019; 36\(2\):209-223. Doi: <https://n9.cl/z9k1b>](#)

[Olivares B. Descripción del manejo de suelos en sistemas de producción agrícola del sector Hamaca de Anzoátegui, Venezuela. La Granja: Revista de Ciencias de la Vida. 2016. 23\(1\): 14–24. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.17163/lgr.n23.2016.02>](#)

[Olivares B, Hernández R, Coelho R, Molina JC, Pereira Y. Analysis of climate types: Main strategies for sustainable decisions in agricultural areas of Carabobo, Venezuela. Scientia Agropecuaria. 2018a; 9\(3\): 359 – 369. Doi: \[10.17268/sci.agropecu.2018.03.07\]\(https://doi.org/10.17268/sci.agropecu.2018.03.07\)](#)

[Olivares B, Hernández R, Arias A, Molina JC, Pereira Y. Zonificación agroclimática del cultivo de maíz para la sostenibilidad de la producción agrícola en Carabobo, Venezuela. Revista Universitaria de Geografía. 2018b; 27 \(2\): 139-159. Doi: <https://n9.cl/ah6c>](#)

[Olivares B. Tropical conditions of seasonal rain in the dry-land agriculture of Carabobo, Venezuela. La Granja: Journal of Life Sciences. 2018; 27\(1\):86-102. <http://doi.org/10.17163/lgr.n27.2018.07>](#)

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 11 pt, English (United States)

Formatted: Font: (Default) Arial, 11 pt

[Cortez A, Olivares B, Parra R, Lobo D, Rodríguez MF, Rey JC. Descripción de los eventos de sequía meteorológica en localidades de la cordillera central, Venezuela. Ciencia, Ingenierías y Aplicaciones. 2018; 1 \(1\):22-44. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.22206/cyap.2018.viil.pp23-45>](#)

[Cortez A, Rodríguez MF, Rey JC, Ovalles F, González W, Parra R, Olivares B, Marquina J. Variabilidad espacio temporal de la precipitación en el estado Guárico, Venezuela. Rev. Fac. Agron. \(LUZ\). 2016; 33 \(3\): 292-310. Doi: <https://n9.cl/pmdck>](#)

[Paredes-Trejo F, Olivares B. El desafío de la sequía en Venezuela. En: Núñez Cobo, J. y Verbist, K. \(Eds.\). Atlas de Sequía de América Latina y el Caribe. 2018; \(pp.127-136\). Francia: UNESCO.](#)

[Olivares B, Parra R, Cortez A. Characterization of precipitation patterns in Anzoátegui state, Venezuela. Ería. 2017a; 3 \(3\): 353-365. Doi: <https://n9.cl/llwyx>](#)

[Olivares B, Cortez A, Rodríguez M, Parra R, Lobo D, Rey JC. Análisis temporal de la sequía meteorológica en localidades semiáridas de Venezuela. UGCiencia. 2016; 22 \(1\):11-24. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.18634/ugcj.22v.1i.481>](#)

[Olivares B, Lobo D, Cortez A, Rodríguez MF, Rey JC. Socio-economic characteristics and methods of agricultural production of indigenous community Kashaama, Anzoátegui, Venezuela. Rev. Fac. Agron. \(LUZ\). 2017b; 34 \(2\): 187-215. Doi: <https://n9.cl/clm17>](#)