

## Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Research in Agriculture and Forestry</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRAF_94482
Title of the Manuscript:	Medicinal plants traditionally used for the treatment of skin diseases in Southern Punjab, Pakistan
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajraf.com/index.php/AJRAF/editorial-policy> )

**Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<p><b>Ms AJRAF 94482</b> <u>Title</u></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>Medicinal plants traditionally used for the treatment of skin diseases in Southern Punjab, Pakistan</b></p> <p>Very good brief title</p> <p><b>Abstract</b> Try to create a gap or state the problem being addressed in one sentence or two. The bolded statements (below) shouldn't be hidden in discussion where they sound misplaced, they belong to abstract or introduction to capture the leader's attention</p> <p><b>Herbal practitioners in the study region are well-versed in the use of therapeutic herbs, but many are hesitant to share their expertise with others. However, this vital information is in danger of being lost by the next generation. The purpose of this research study was to investigate the dermatological properties of medicinal plants used by different ethnic communities in southern Punjab, Pakistan and it seeks to establish a foundation for the development of novel medications with anti-skin activity.</b></p> <p><b>Methods</b> What is the justification of using southern Punjab districts of Multan and Vehari as the area of the study? It is not clear why the study is carried out in this area. It is not clear where the <b>pilot study</b> was done. It is not clear it was tested for validity and reliability. What the <b>experts verified</b> was the questionnaire but this must be tested and its validity and reliability should be statistically tested. Herbal practitioners more often than not will never reveal in totality their take on the plants that they use in their practice due to trade secrets. How did the author delimit this? 120 experts from southern Punjab were interviewed, what is the <b>rationale of picking this number</b>? Why not 80,150 Or even 200? In methods, how were the participants selected? <b>What of exclusion criteria?</b></p> <p><b>Discussion</b> <b>Herbal medication is traditionally used to cure different ailments including dermatological disorders is deeply ingrained in Pakistan. However, ethnobotanical investigations on the treatment of skin ailments in southern Punjab, Pakistan, remained spatially scattered.</b> The statement above could have been shifted to abstract to introduce the leader to the work in this article The author(s) has very good results. However, there is very little discussion of the results from <b>Twenty-one (21) medicinal plants belonging to 18 different..... These findings agreed with those of [36, 37].</b> Kindly expound on the discussion by following what is normally the policy for instance the author should in this discussion do the following; i. Compare the findings with other studies and discuss why things are the way they are. ii. Contrast where need be and suggest why there seems to be the differences observed. iii. Critic positively or negatively the results. Only then will that be called a discussion. NB. Avoid quoting literature that you are not relating to your work e.g. <b>The skin is the biggest organ..... treating dermatological problems, whether as monotherapy or in combination with other treatments [32].</b> <b>Simply discuss your work in relation to others.</b></p> <p><b>Conclusion.</b> The conclusion is well done.</p> <p><b>Recommendations</b> There is no recommendation at all. What is the relevance of this work. Is there any take home message that can be implemented? <b>The leader is left wondering.</b></p> <p><b>References</b> This section is well done with adequate references nevertheless <b>seventeen (17)</b> need to be replaced with newer ones after all there are adequate references that are up to date (five years) addressing the same areas. Most of the outdated literature is speaking to the same issues of medicinal plants. Again, too much literature doesn't imply that the author has read all of it. The references should be about 5 years old to avoid being obsolete. Does it mean there are no recent studies in this area? These include; <b>References:</b> [8] Musa AM, Ibrahim MA, Aliyu AB, Abdullahi MS, Tajuddeen N, Ibrahim H, Oyewale AO. <b>2015.</b> Chemical composition and antimicrobial activity of hexane leaf extract of Anisopus mannii (Asclepiadaceae). Journal of Intercultural Ethnopharmacology 4(2):129. [9] Picardi, A., Lega, I., Tarolla, E., <b>2013.</b> Suicide risk in skin disorders. Clin. Dermatol. 31, 47–56.</p>	

**Review Form 1.6**

	<p>[10] Abbasi, A.M., Khan, M.A., Ahmad, M., Zafar, M., Jahan, S., Sultana, S., <b>2010</b>. Ethnopharmacological application of medicinal plants to cure skin diseases and in folk cosmetics among the tribal communities of North-West Frontier Province, Pakistan. J. Ethnopharmacology. 128, 322–335.</p> <p>[11] Basra, M.K.A., Shahrukh, M., <b>2009</b>. Burden of skin diseases. Expert Rev. Pharmacoecon. Outcomes Res. 9, 271–283.</p> <p>[13] Roderick, H.J., Johns, N.E., Williams, H.C., Bolliger, I.W., Dellavalle, R.P., Margolis, D.J., Marks, R., Naldi, L., Weinstock, M.A., Wulf, S.K., Michaud, C., Murray, C., Naghavi, M., <b>2014</b>. The global burden of skin disease in 2010: an analysis of the prevalence and impact of skin conditions. J.I. J. Invest. Dermatol. 134, 1527–1534.</p> <p>[14] Tabassum, N., Hamdani, M., <b>2014</b>. Plants used to treat skin diseases. Phcog. Rev. 8, 52–60.</p> <p>[15] Priya, K.S., Gnanamani, A., Radhakrishnan, N., Babu, M., <b>2002</b>. Healing potential of Datura alba on burn wounds in albino rats. J. Ethnopharmacology. 83, 193–199.</p> <p>[16] De Wet, H., Nciki, S., Vuuren, S.F. van, <b>2013</b>. Medicinal plants used for the treatment of various skin disorders by a rural community in northern Maputaland, South Africa. J. Ethnobiology &amp; Ethnomedicine. 9, 1–10.</p> <p>[17] Azhar MF. <b>2014</b>. Ethnobotanical Potential of Medicinal Shrubs in Socioeconomic Uplift of Cholistan Rangeland Dwellers. Doctoral dissertation, University of Agriculture Faisalabad-Pakistan.</p> <p>[18] Azhar MF, Siddiqui MT, Ishaque M, Tanveer A. <b>2014</b>. Study of ethnobotany and indigenous use of Calotropis procera (Ait.) in cholistan desert, Punjab, Pakistan. Pakistan Journal of Agricultural Research 52(1):117–126.</p> <p>[19] Azhar, MF, Aziz A, Haider MS, Nawaz MF, Zulfiqar, MA. <b>2015</b>. Exploring the ethnobotany of Haloxylon recurvum (Khar) and Haloxylon salicornicum (Lana) in Cholistan desert, Pakistan. Pakistan Journal of Agricultural Sciences 52:1085-1090.</p> <p>[34] Salhi, S., Fadli, M., Zidane, L., Douira, A., <b>2010</b>. Etudes floristique et ethnobotanique des plantes m´edicinales de la ville de K´enitra (Maroc). Lazaroa 31, 133–146.</p> <p>[35] Sharma, J., Gairola, S., Sharma, Y.P., Gaur, R.D., <b>2014</b>. Ethnomedicinal plants used to treat skin diseases by Tharu community of district Udham Singh Nagar, Uttarakhand, India. J. Ethnopharmacology. 158, 140–206.</p> <p>[38] Zhang JL, Cui M, He Y, Yu HL, &amp; Guo DA. <b>2005</b>. Chemical fingerprint and metabolic fingerprint analysis of Danshen injection by HPLC–UV and HPLC–MS methods. Journal of Pharmaceutical and Biomedical Analysis 36(5):1029-1035.</p> <p>[39] Ahmad M, Sultana S, Fazl-i-Hadi S, Ben Hadda T, Rashid S, Zafar M, Yaseen G. <b>2014</b>. An Ethnobotanical study of Medicinal Plants in high mountainous region of Chail valley (District Swat-Pakistan). Journal of Ethnobiology and Ethnomedicine 10(1):1-18.</p> <p>[40] Bibi T. Ahmad M, Tareen RB, Tareen NM, Jabeen R, Rehman S.U., Yaseen G. <b>2014</b>. Ethnobotany of medicinal plants in district Mastung of Balochistan province-Pakistan. Journal of Ethnopharmacology 157:79-89.</p> <p>[43] Shil S, Choudhury MD, Das S. <b>2014</b>. Indigenous knowledge of medicinal plants used by the Reang tribe of Tripura state of India. Journal of Ethnopharmacology 152:135-141.</p>	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	All the revisions should be done	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments		

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer’s comment	Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes. Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	Lucy Karani
Department, University & Country	Kisii University, Kenya