

**Review Form 1.6**

Journal Name:	<b>Asian Journal of Probability and Statistics</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_AJPAS_93716</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Proposed Nonparametric Tests for the Umbrella Alternative in a Mixed Design for Location and Scale</b>
Type of the Article	

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://www.journalajpas.com/index.php/AJPAS/editorial-policy> )

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(1) In the beginning of section 2.5, the authors mention use of SAS for their simulation studies. Maybe the authors could provide either the full SAS code or at least a link to the full SAS code.</li> <li>(2) Several times, the authors mention that certain test statistics used are asymptotically Normal. Can the authors provide references to suggest just how large of sample sizes are needed, in order for the Normal approximations to be reasonable. My concern is that the authors use sample sizes of only 12, as they mention in the first paragraph of section 2.5.</li> </ol>	
<b>Minor</b> REVISION comments	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(1) There seems to be an extra right parenthesis in <math>(2n_p+3)</math>, <math>(2m_p+3)</math>, and <math>(A_p+3*MA_p)</math> in equations (3), (10), and (28), respectively.</li> <li>(2) Below equation (6): Replace "The number of treatments" with "the number of treatments".</li> <li>(3) Above equation (9): Fix the spacing in "in the Moses test [9 ]was applied".</li> <li>(4) In the title of section 2.2, replace "Proposed test one" with "Proposed Test One".</li> <li>(5) In section 2.5, the sentence "The call function for the t-distribution is" needs to be combined with the previous line of text.</li> </ol>	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	This paper is interesting and well-written.	

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Steven T. Garren</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>James Madison University, USA</b>