

Original Research Article

“Comparative efficacy of insecticides, NSKE and karanj oil against shoot and fruit borer, *Eariasvittella* (Fabricius.) on okra”

ABSTRACT

A field trail was conducted at Central Research Farm, SHUATS, Naini, Prayagraj, U.P. during *kharif* season of 2021. The field was laid in Randomised block Design with seven treatments replicated thrice viz., Neem oil 3%, Indoxacarb 14.5% SC, Lambda cyhalothrin 5% EC, NSKE 5%, Emamectin benzoate 5SG, Karanj oil 2%, Flubendiamide 480 SC along with control plot. The results after first and second revealed that among the different treatments, Emamectin benzoate 5SG (10.82% and 11.64%) recorded lowest percent infestation of *Eariasvittella* followed by Flubendiamide 480 SC (15.92% and 17.25%), Indoxacarb 14.5SC (17.06% and 18.45%), Lambda cyhalothrin 5% EC (18.13% and 18.52%), Neem oil 3% (20.44% and 20.69%), NSKE 5% (21.44% and 21.12%) and Karanj oil 2% (24.16% and 23.61) was the least effective among all treatments with percent shoot and fruit infestation respectively. Among all treatments studied, the best and most economical treatment was Emamectin benzoate 5SG (1:5.60), Flubendiamide 480 SC (1:5.44), Indoxacarb 14.5SC (1:5.33), Lambda cyhalothrin 5% EC (1:5.08) followed by Neem oil 3% (1:4.89), NSKE 5% (1:4.81) and the least cost benefit ratio was observed in Karanj oil 2% (1:4.66) when compared to control plot (1:2.82).

Keywords: Botanicals, *Eariasvittella*, Emamectin benzoate, Flubendiamide, Karanj oil, NSKE, Okra.

Comment [PT1]: trial

Comment [PT2]: for international journal need to indicate what period this is

Comment [PT3]: sampling or what?

Comment [PT4]: No statistics to support this

INTRODUCTION

Okra (*Abelmoschus esculentus* L.) belongs to family Malvaceae, which is locally known as Bhendi and Lady's finger worldwide. It is very popular summer vegetable for home gardening while it is also grown commercially throughout the world especially in Indo-Pakistan sub-continent. It is probably originated in Ethiopian region of Africa and is one of the most common and popular vegetables grown in tropical and subtropical regions in India. (Pachole et al., 2017).

Okra fruits are considered as good source of protein, besides carbohydrates, minerals and fats. Its fruits and fibre from stalk are used in paper industry. The nutritive value of okra/100 g of edible portion contains carbohydrates (1.5%), protein (2.0 g), total fat (0.1 g), dietary fibre (9%), folates (88 mcg), niacin (1.00 mg), pantothenic acid (0.245 mg), riboflavin (0.060 mg), thiamine (0.200 mg), vitamin C (21.1 mg), vitamin A (375 IU), vitamin E (0.36 mg), vitamin K (53 mcg), sodium (8 mg), potassium (303 mg), calcium (81 mg), copper (0.094 mg), iron (0.80 mg), magnesium (57 mg), phosphorus (63 mg), selenium (0.7 mcg), zinc (0.60 mg), carotene (225 mcg) and lutein and zeaxanthin (516 mcg). (Source: USDA National Nutrient Data base, 2021).

Globally India ranks first in okra production of around 5794.0 thousand tonnes (72% of total world production) having area of 564.0 thousand hectares with an annual production of 6371 thousand million tonnes and productivity of 12.9 million tonnes/ha. Andhra Pradesh is the leading okra producing state which has production of around 884.2 thousand tonnes from an area of 79.90 thousand hectares, with a productivity of 15 tonnes/ha. (NHB, 2020-21).

Kamble et al., (2014) reported shoot and fruit borer infestation on okra as 32.14 percent on number basis and 31.31 percent on weight basis. The adult female of okra shoot and fruit borer, *Earias vitella* lays eggs individually on leaves, floral buds and on tender fruits. Small brown caterpillars bore into the top shoot and feeds inside the shoot before fruit formation and the shoot will become wilted and dry. A larva attacks a number of stems and pods one after another.

Okra is grown during summer and Kharif seasons. Among insect pests infesting okra, shoot and fruit borer [*Earias vittella* (Fabricius)] is one of the serious pests causing 40-50 per cent damage to okra fruits during both seasons (Srinivasan and Gowder, 1960).

Comment [PT5]: Introduction needs to be rewritten clearly stating the problem. Its relevance and the objectives of the study

Comment [PT6]: delete

Comment [PT7]: delete

Comment [PT8]: need for consistency in citing references

Comment [PT9]: something wrong with figures. Rephrase for clarity

Comment [PT10]: replace using with

Comment [PT11]: delete

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The experiment was conducted during kharif season 2021 at Central Research Farm, SHUATS, Naini, Prayagraj, Uttar Pradesh, India, in a Randomized Block Design with seven treatments along with controlled plot replicated three times using variety Kasturi in a plot size of (2m x 2m) at a spacing of (45 x 30 cm) with a recommended package of practices excluding plant protection. The soil of the experimental site was well drained and medium high. The climate of the experimental site is sub-tropical characterized by normal rainfall. Research field is situated at an elevation of 98 meters above sea level at 25° 87' North latitude and 80° 05' East longitudes. The extremes of both summer and winter are experienced while the minimum temperature in winter was 4°C and the maximum temperature reaches up to 45°C in summer.

The observations on infestation of *Earias vitella* were recorded visually per plant from five randomly selected plants and tagged plants in each plot. The insecticides were sprayed at recommended doses when percent infestation reaches ETL (5% fruit infestation) level. Number of infested shoots and fruits from 5 randomly selected plants per plot was counted and recorded at weekly interval after careful examination on the presence of borer and excreta at both vegetative and reproductive stage, which was further converted into percent infestation. Observations were recorded on the number of infested shoots and fruits in each plot a day on 3rd, 7th and 14th days after spraying on selected plants in a plot.

The healthy marketable yield obtained from different treatments was collected separately and weighed. The cost of insecticides used in this experiment was recorded during season of 2020-2021. The cost of botanicals used was obtained from nearby market. The total cost of plant protection consisted of cost of treatments, sprayer rent and labour charges for the spray. There were two sprays throughout the research period and the overall plant protection expenses were calculated. Total income was realized by multiplying the total yield per hectare by the prevailing market price, while the net benefit is obtained by subtracting the total cost of plant protection from total income. Benefit over the control for each sprayed treatment was obtained by subtracting the income of the control treatment from that of each sprayed treatment.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Efficacy of different insecticides on the percent infestation of okra shoot and fruit borer showed that all the treatments were significantly superior in reducing the infestation of shoot

Comment [PT12]: too long and not reader-friendly

Comment [PT13]: what?

Comment [PT14]: Means what?

Comment [PT15]: irrelevant

Comment [PT16]: which is which?

Comment [PT17]: 1. Authors need to give details of the insecticides used, sources, rates, methods of application etc in this section since that is the basis of the paper
2. ETL - source, why start observations after its attainment, Does data on % infestation include the ETL values, were same plants sampled in plots?
3. Sampling methods suspect. Authors could have used established techniques available for the insect

Comment [PT18]: Authors need to state data analysis procedures. For cost benefit analysis authors should use standard existing techniques to make conclusions credible

and fruitborer resulting in increasing the yield, significantly as compared to control. On third day after spray lowest percent infestation of 8.77 was recorded in Emamectin benzoate 5SG followed by Flubendiamide 480 SC (15.18) and Indoxacarb 14.5SC (15.39) treated plots, respective that differed significantly with other treatment plots but statistically at par with each other. The lowest percent infestation was recorded in Emamectin benzoate 5SG (10.64 and 13.06) treated plots followed by Flubendiamide 480 SC (15.84 and 16.72) and Indoxacarb 14.5SC (16.77 and 19.02) respectively on 7th and 14th day after spray. (Table 1)

Emamectin benzoate 5SG treated plots recorded lowest percent infestation in all observations on 3rd, 7th and 14th day after spray with 10.53, 12 and 12.4 followed by Flubendiamide 480 SC (16.33, 16.77 and 18.64). These results are supported by **Sandipet al., (2007)** and **Govindanet al., (2012)**, reported that Emamectin benzoate 5SG proved superior over other insecticides in reducing percent infestation of okra shoot and fruit borer. **Ametaet al., (2010)** found Flubendiamide 480 SC as the most effective treatment.

The yields among the treatments were significant. The highest yield was recorded in Emamectin benzoate 5SG (138.5 q/ha), followed by Flubendiamide 480 SC (135.6 q/ha), Indoxacarb 14.5SC (132.84 q/ha), Lambda cyhalothrin 5% EC (124.9 q/ha), Neem oil 3% (121.7 q/ha), NSKE 5% (118.3 q/ha) and Karanj oil 2% (109.2 q/ha) as compared to control plot (67 q/ha). These findings are supported by **Sandipet al., (2007)**, **Nilam and Patel (2012)**, and **Govindanet al., (2012)**. Among the treatments studied, the best and most economical treatment was Emamectin benzoate 5SG (1:5.60), followed by Flubendiamide 480 SC (1:5.44), Indoxacarb 14.5SC (1:5.33), Lambda cyhalothrin 5% EC (1:5.08), Neem oil 3% (1:4.89), NSKE 5% (1:4.81) and Karanj oil 2% (1:4.66) as compared to control plot (1:2.82). These findings are supported by **Shridhara et al., (2018)**, **Jat and Ameta (2013)** and **Lal et al., (2008)**.

Comment [PT19]: No statistics provided in table to enable mean separation for this and B:C ratio

Comment [PT20]: This section simply repeats the figures in the table. Authors do not attempt to explain the scientific basis for their results and make very scant references. Did these references test exactly the same insecticides at same rates etc. If so why was this work done, just to confirm?

Table 1: Efficacy of insecticides, NSKE and karanj oil on percent shoot and fruit infestation of shoot and fruit borer on okra

S.No.	Treatments	Percent shoot and fruit infestation of shoot and fruit borer on okra						Yield (q/ha)	B:C Ratio
		First spray			Second spray				
		3 DAS	7 DAS	14 DAS	3DAS	7 DAS	14 DAS		
T ₁	Neem oil 3%	21.05 ^b	19.42 ^{cd}	20.84 ^{cd}	21.61 ^b	19.93 ^{bc}	20.52 ^{cd}	121.7	1:4.89
T ₂	Indoxacarb 14.5% SC	15.39 ^c	16.77 ^{de}	19.02 ^{de}	17.00 ^c	19.14 ^{cd}	19.21 ^d	132.8	1:5.33
T ₃	Lambda cyhalothrin 5% EC	17.6 ^c	18.36 ^{cde}	18.43 ^{de}	18.03 ^c	18.09 ^{cd}	19.45 ^{cd}	124.9	1:5.08
T ₄	NSKE 5%	21.29 ^b	19.78 ^c	23.24 ^{bc}	21.69 ^b	19.98 ^{bc}	21.7 ^c	118.3	1:4.81
T ₅	Emamectin Benzoate 5% SG	8.77 ^d	10.64 ^f	13.06 ^f	10.53 ^d	12.00 ^e	12.4 ^e	138.5	1:5.60
T ₆	Karanj oil %	23.86 ^{ab}	23.63 ^b	25.00 ^b	23.82 ^b	22.45 ^b	24.55 ^b	109.2	1:4.66
T ₇	Flubendiamide 480 SC	15.18 ^c	15.84 ^c	16.72 ^c	16.33 ^c	16.77 ^d	18.64 ^d	135.6	1:5.44
T ₀	Control	25.91 ^a	28.27 ^a	29.27 ^a	33.36 ^a	34.6 ^a	36.82 ^a	67	1:2.82
	F-test	S	S	S	S	S	S
	S. Ed (±)	1.03	0.91	0.94	1.16	0.87	0.79
	C.D. (P = 0.5)	3.13	2.75	2.84	3.53	2.65	2.41

REFERENCES

- Ameta, O.P., Kumar, A. and Dashora, P.K. (2010).** Efficacy of flubendiamide 480 SC brinjal fruit and shoot borer, *Leucinodesorbonalis* Guenee. *Pestology*, 34 (8): 41-45.
- Govindan, K., Gunasekaran, K., Veeramani, K. and Kuttalam, S. (2013).** Field and laboratory evaluation of biological compatibility of Emamectin benzoate 5 SG with agrochemicals against okra fruit borer (*Helicoverpaarmigera* Hubner). *International Journal of Plant and Animal Science*, 1: 77-87.
- Jat, S.K. and Ameta, O.P. (2013).** Relative efficacy of biopesticides and newer insecticides against *Helicoverpaarmigera* (Hub) in tomato. *An International Quarterly Journal of Life Sciences*, 8(2): 579-582.
- Kamble, Kulkarni, S.R. and Patil, S.K. (2014).** Efficacy of newer combination insecticides against shoot and fruit borer, *Eariasvittella* (Fabricius) on okra. *Pest management in Horticultural Ecosystems*, 20(2): 242-244.
- Lal, K.M., Singh, S.P., Kumari, K. and Singh, S.N. (2008).** Bio-efficacy of Beta-cyfluthrin, Lambda-cyhalothrin and imidacloprid against *Eariasvittella* Fab. in Okra. *Annals of Plant Protection Sciences*, 16(1): 21-24.
- National Horticultural Board (N.H.B.) (2020-21).**
- Nilam, R.B. and Patel, J.J. (2012).** Evaluation of various synthetic insecticides against *Eariasvittella* fabricius infesting okra. *AGRES – An International e-Journal*, 1(3): 367-375.
- Pachole, S.H., Thakur, S. and Simon, S. (2017).** Comparative bioefficacy of selected chemical insecticides and bio-rationals against shoot and fruit borer [*Eariasvittella* (Fabricius)] on okra [*Abelmoschus esculentus* (L.) Moench]. *Journal of Pharmacognosy and Phytochemistry*, 6(4): 1836-1839.
- Sandip, P., Mondal, S., Samanta, A. and Chatterjee, M.L. (2007).** Bioefficacy of some new insecticides against the okra shoot and fruit borer, *Eariasvittella* (F.). *Pest Management and Economic Zoology*, 15(1): 53-56.
- Shridhara, M., Hanchinal, S.G., Sreenivas, A.G., Hosamani, A.C. and Nidagundi, J.M. (2019).** Evaluation of Newer Insecticides for the Management of Brinjal Shoot and Fruit Borer (*Leucinodesorbonalis* Guenee) (Lepidoptera: Crambidae). *International Journal Current Microbiology and Applied Sciences*, 8(3): 2582-2592.

Srinivasan, P.M. and Gowder, R.B. (1960). Preliminary notes on the control of bhendi shoot and fruit borer, *Eariasfabia* and *Eariasinsulana*. *Indian Journal of Agricultural Sciences*, 30(1): 55-57.

USDA National Nutrient database, 2021.