

Review Article

Bioefficacy of insecticidal nematodes against stored grain pests-an overview

Abstract: Stored grain insect pests are difficult to control. Though chemical insecticides are effective in controlling pests, other environment friendly methods have been advocated. Entomopathogenic nematodes are potential biocontrol agent against a wide range of insect pests. This review highlights the research findings regarding the use of entomopathogenic nematodes against stored grain insects.

Comment [HM1]: Sorry!
Some results are needed in this paragraph

Key words: Stored grain pests, biological control agent, entomopathogenic nematodes (EPNs), bioefficacy.

Introduction

The insect pests attack and destroy large quantities of stored grains and products during postharvest processing and storage in farm bins, grain processing facilities, warehouses, retail stores, and eventually also on the consumer shelves. Stored grain/ product pests are generally difficult to control using traditional method as they hide in cracks and crevices, under perforated floors, and inside machinery used for processing of stored products. Thus they have a major economic impact on the food industry due to the costs associated with their management, monitoring, rejection, and return of contaminated shipments and failure to meet regulations that required to and pass inspections. Therefore, there is a need to protect stored food products from attack by insects.

Comment [HM2]: Most of information presented must be cited the source

Important stored grain pests

Comment [HM3]: Idem comment 2

The Indian meal moth (*Plodia interpunctella*), the larval stages feed on different kinds of cereal grains and processed dry foods.

The Mediterranean flour moth (*Ephesiakuehniella*), the larval stage feed on various types of flour.

The Mealworm (*Tenebriomolitor*), larvae feed on flour of cereals.

The kharpa beetle (*Trogodermagranarium*) and the warehouse beetle (*Trogodermavariabile*), larvae feed on dried cereal grains, dried spices and food products. These are destructive stored product pest due to their elevated survival potential, preference for dry conditions and resistance to many insecticides.

The red flour beetle (*Tribolium castaneum*) feeds on cereal grains and dried food products. The confused flour beetle (*T. confusum*) is another pest that contaminates a wide range of food products, from cereals to spices.

The granary weevil (*Sitophilus granarius*) and the sawtoothed grain beetle (*Oryzaephilus surinamensis*) are important pests of stored grain of wheat and barley and other cereal products, spread mostly in moderate climate.

The lesser grain borer (*Rhyzopertha dominica*) is a destructive, internal grain feeder of stored cereals throughout the world.

Synthetic pesticides, especially fumigants, have achieved sufficient pest control at low cost for stored grain pests. As the public concern about chemical pesticide related risks increases, the development of alternative, environmentally more caring disinfestations methods of stored commodities should be pursued. Other techniques such as the use of extreme temperatures and the use of biological control agents are also utilized effectively. However, any organism has been

considered as an undesirable contaminant of stored product, limited the applicability of biological control measure.

Entomopathogenic nematodes (EPNs)

Laboratory experiments showed that entomopathogenic nematodes (EPNs) are the potential biological agents for suppressing some species of stored products pests. The free living third-stage infective juveniles (IJs) of the entomopathogenic nematodes such as *Steinernema* and *Heterorhabditis* under the families Steinernematidae and Heterorhabditidae respectively, get into their hosts body through mouth, anus and spiracles and release symbiotic mutualistic bacteria into the hemocoel causing septicemia or toxemia and finally the death of the insect within a few days.

Generally, for beetle species, entomopathogenic nematodes are considered more effective against the larval stage, in comparison with adults (Kakouli-Duarte *et al.*, 1997, Ramos-Rodriguez *et al.*, 2006, Athanassiou *et al.*, 2008). Most of the adults are more mobile and may partially avoid the contact with entomopathogenic nematodes. The successful application of entomopathogenic nematodes in storage environments for controlling post-harvest insects is highly dependent on several biotic and abiotic factors, such as the host life stage, temperature, and relative humidity. It is known that the grains and the storage environment are dry and application of entomopathogenic nematodes to dry storage environment is risky. Entomopathogenic nematodes have to overcome this problem to become a reliable alternative for commercial applications in warehouses and storage facilities.

Utilization of entomopathogenic nematodes against stored grain pests

Entomopathogenic nematodes (EPNs) have been used against different species of stored grain insects. Entomopathogenic nematodes (EPN) species differ in their capability to withstand

Comment [HM4]: Please provide the source of information

Comment [HM5]: The kind of citation need to be specific to the information related too.

Comment [HM6]: EPNs and EPN which one is the correct?
Please harmonize!

rapid desiccation (RD). Infective juveniles of *S. carpocapsae* are a better adaptable and tolerant than *S. feltiae* or *H. bacteriophora* as, an optimal relative humidity (RH) of > 90% is required by *S. feltiae* and *H. bacteriophora* while maintaining RH equivalent to 74% could sustain survival of *S. carpocapsae* under RD (Ramakrishnan *et al.*, 2022). Understanding the rate of desiccation among IJs of different EPN species, at range of relative humidity (RH) conditions, as well as the influence of these conditions on nematodes efficacy against those pests will enable to develop formulations to enhance EPN survival and efficacy.

Alikhan *et al.*, (1985) showed that *S. feltiae* was moderately effective against the granary weevil (*Sitophilus granarius*) and caused low mortality to *T. confusum* larvae. Cruiser entomopathogenic nematode, *H. bacteriophora* and *H. megidis* are more virulent against adult of Indian meal moth (*Plodia interpunctella*) than against larvae (Mbata & Shapiro-Ilan, 2005). Intermediate foraging entomopathogenic nematodes *S. riobrave* have a potential to kill over 65% larvae of Indian meal moths, Mediterranean flour moths, sawtoothed grain beetles, mealworms, red flour beetles and warehouse beetles. Intermediate foraging entomopathogenic nematode *S. feltiae* can cause over 90% larval mortality of Indian meal moth, Mediterranean flour moth, red flour beetles (Ramos-Rodriguez *et al.*, 2006). However, they found that *S. carpocapsae* was more effective than *S. feltiae* for killing of larvae of *E. kuehniella*. Ramos-Rodriguez *et al.*, (2006) found that entomopathogenic nematodes were generally more effective against larvae of the red flour beetle, *Tribolium castaneum* than against adults.

Tradan *et al.*, (2006), noted that high doses of *S. carpocapsae* were required to achieve a high level of mortality against the sawtoothed grain beetle (*Oryzaephilus surinamensis*). *S. feltiae* was more effective against *S. granaries* and *O. surinamensis* at 20 and 25°C than at 15°C. Athanassiou *et al.*, (2008) found that virulence of *S. feltiae* varied considerably among

Comment [HM7]: Please revise if the proposed author name is correct

different strains, against adults and larvae of *T. confusum* and larvae of *E. kuehniella*. Intermediate foraging entomopathogenic nematode *S. feltiae* can cause over 79% larval mortality of the flour beetle. Furthermore, in that study, the most effective strain against *T. confusum* larvae was not effective against *E. kuehniella* larvae. *E. kuehniella* larvae wheat treatments with *S. feltiae* provided mortality that ranged from 36.7 to 78.3% whereas no mortality was noted in the treatment with *S. carpocapsae* at 100 IJs per ml at 20 or at 30°C.

Also, at 20°C, in wheat treated with *H. bacteriophora* at 100 IJs per ml, very few larvae were dead. *R. dominica* adults, at 20°C, the mortality of adults in wheat treated with *S. feltiae* and *S. carpocapsae* did not exceed 23.3 and 41.7%, respectively, at 20,000 IJs per ml, with no significant differences among doses. In the case of *S. oryzae* adults, the mortality was very low at all doses, and temperatures and did not exceed 9%. Mortality of *T. confusum* adults did not exceed 17% regardless of the entomopathogenic nematode species tested.

In contrast, mortality of *T. confusum* larvae was notably higher and exceeded 56% in wheat treated with 10,000 or 20,000 IJs per ml of *S. feltiae* at 20°C. Unlike *S. feltiae* and *S. carpocapsae*, the application of *H. bacteriophora* resulted in lower mortality levels (Athanassiou *et al.*, 2010). Mortality rates of adult specimen of rice weevil (*S. oryzae*) depend on temperature and concentrations of nematode suspension (*S. feltiae* B30, B49 and 3162), as well as on the strain of nematodes (Laznik *et al.*, 2010). *S. feltiae*, *S. carpocapsae* and *H. bacteriophora* killed 87.8, 63.3, and 60.0% respectively of the exposed large larvae (*T. granarium*) on stored wheat treated with 50,000 IJs/ml after 8 days of exposure at 30°C under laboratory condition (Karanastasi *et al.*, 2020).

The concentration of 150 IJs/beetle *Tribolium confusum* and *Rhyzopertha dominica* achieved a maximum mortality of 100% for *S. pakistanense* at 30°C. The same concentrations revealed that

Formatted: Font: Italic

all four species of EPN were able to cause mortal effects depended on temperature and concentrations. *S. pakistanense*(LM-07) and *S. bifurcatum* (LM-30) were the most effective at 150 IJs/beetle at 30°C and *S. affinae* (GB-14) and *S. cholashanense* (GB-22) at the same concentration at 20°C(Javed *et al.*,2020).*Steinernemariobrave*, *Heterorhabditisbacteriophora*showed various levels of efficacy against Cowpea weevil(*Callosobruchus maculates*), Khapra beetle (*Trogodermagranarium*), and Rust red flour beetle (*Triboliumcastaneum*).The highest mortality rate 16.67% was recorded with *S.riobrave*(2000 IJs / ml) after 72 hours post-treatment of *C. Maculates*, while the lowest rate of mortality (1.33%)of adult insects for rusty flour beetle at the dose of 500 IJs / ml after 24 hours (Qader *et al.*,2021).

Conclusion

A thorough knowledge of the biology and technology of the stored product and above all of the pests, their physiology and behavior and their natural enemies is essential for management of these pests. Improved design of factories, granaries, and warehouses to avoid insect infestation and facilitate control operations at an early stage in the planning of a new building. Environmental conditions in these buildings are very important along with good sanitary measures and sophisticated monitoring techniques in order to render the conditions unfavourable for development of the insects (Scholler *et al.*, 1997). To establish a treatment threshold, direct sampling, location of insect infestation, the insect species present, and their developmental stage were made. Since stored product environments are enclosed, biological control options are restricted to augmentative biological control. For large scale application, products for control have to be ready to use and easy to apply by means of simple equipment. Also, the provision of an aqueous environment in the insecticide formulation of the entomopathogenic nematode is

Comment [HM8]: Too long conclusion!
Please revise to be concise.

required so that the nematode can reach the target. The virulence of entomopathogenic nematodes against post harvest insects varies depending on the nematode species and strains. Usually, only a single nematode species or strain is not equally effective against all major stored product insect pests, therefore, one nematode species or strain cannot be suitable for controlling all species present in the storage environment, where several insect species coexist. With the discovery of new, virulent strains, evaluation of heat-tolerant strains, use of innovative, enhanced methods of formulation and application, such as encapsulation or bait traps, could boost the exploitation of entomopathogenic nematode in storage facilities against post-harvest insects. Additional investigation is needed to clarify the level of consumer's acceptance on pathogen-treated (biocontrol agent) food, because the use of pathogens directly in food may not be compatible with the consumer's demands (Athanasios *et al.*, 2008).

References

- Alikhan, MA., Bednarek A., Grabiec S.- 1985. The physiological and morphological characteristics of *Neoplectanacarpocapsae* (Nematoda: Steinernematidae) in two insect hosts. *Journal of Invertebrate Pathology*. 45: 168-173
- Arbogast, RT. 1984. Biological control of stored product insects: status and Prospects. In: Baur FJ (Ed). *Insect Management for Food Storage and Processing*, American Association of Cereal Chemists, Inc., St. Paul, Minneapolis, USA. pp.225-238.
- Arbogast, RT. 1984. Natural enemies as control agents for stored product insect. In: Mills RB., Wright VF, Pedersen JR, McGaughey WH, Beeman RW, Kramer KJ, Speirs RD, Storey CL (Eds.). *Proceedings of the 3rd international working conference on stored product Entomology*, Oct 23-28, Kansas State University, Manhattan, Kansas, USA. Pp. 360-374.

Comment [HM9]: Please revise to harmonize according to the comma after the author name and to other punctuations

Comment [HM10]: Why a?
Where is b?

Athanassiou, CG., Palyvos, NE., and Kakouli-Duarte, T. 2008. Insecticidal effect of *Steinernema feltiae* (Filipjev) (Nematoda: Steinernematidae) against *Tribolium confusum* Val (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae) and *Ephesiakuehniella* (Zeller) (Lepidoptera: Pyralidae) in stored wheat. *Journal of Stored Product Research* 44:52-57.

Athanassiou, CG., Kavallieratos NC., Menti H., Karanastasi E. 2010. Mortality of four stored product pests in stored wheat when exposed to doses of three entomopathogenic nematodes. *Journal of Economic Entomology*. 103(3) :977-984. DOI: 10.1603/EC09202

Begley, JW. 1990. Efficacy against insects in habitats other than soil, pp. 215-231. In: R. Gaugler and H.K. Kaya (eds.), *Entomopathogenic nematodes in biological control*. CRC, Boca Raton, FL.

Brower, JH., Smith, L., Vail, PV., and Flinn, PW. 1996. Biological control. Pp. 223-286. In: B.H. Subramanyam and D.W. Hagstrum, eds. *Integrated management of insect in stored products pest*. Dekker, New York .

Fayyz S., Javed S., Rumbos CI., Athanassiou C.G. 2017. Control of stored grain pests by entomopathogenic nematodes. In: *Biocontrol agents: entomopathogenic and slug parasitic nematodes*. Abd-Elgawad MMM, Askary TH, Coupland J (editors). CABI. pp. 208-222 .doi: 10.1079/ 9781786390004.0000.

Fayyz S., Javed S. 2009. Laboratory evaluation of seven Pakistani strains of entomopathogenic nematodes against a stored grain insect pest, Pulse beetle *Callosobruchus chinensis* (L.). *Journal of Nematology* .41:255-260.

Glazer, I. 1992. Survival and efficacy of *Steinernema carpocapsae* in an exposed environment. *Biocontrol Science and Technology*. 2: 101-107.

Formatted: French (France)

- Javed S., Khanum TA., Khan S. 2020. Biocontrol potential of entomopathogenic nematode species against *Triboliumconfusum* (Jac.) (Coleoptera: Tenebrionidae) and *Rhyzoperthadominica* (Fab.) (Coleoptera: Bostrichidae) under laboratory conditions. Egyptian Journal of Biological Pest Control. 30:5. doi.org/10.1186/s41938-020-0206-9.
- Kakouli-Duarte, T., Labuschagne L., Hague N.G.M.1997. Biological control of the black vine weevil, *Otiorhynchussulcatus*(Coleoptera: Curculionidae) with entomopathogenic nematodes (Nematoda: Rhabditida).Annals of Applied Biology.131: 11-27.
- Karanastasi E., Kavallieratos NG.,Boukouvala MC., Christodoulopoulou AD., Papadopoulou AA.2020.Effect of threentomopathogenic nematode species to *Trogodermagranarium*Everts (Coleoptera: Dermestidae) larvae on stored wheat. Journal of Stored Products Research 88:101641.
- Laznik Z., Toth T., Lakatos T.,Vidrih M.,Trdan S.2010.The activity of three new strains of *Steinernemafeltiae* against adults of Sitophilusoryzae under laboratory conditions.Journal of Food,Agriculture & Environment.8(1): 150-154.
- Mbata GN., Shapiro-Ilan DI. 2005. Laboratory evaluation of virulence of heterorhabditid nematodes to *Plodiainterpunctella*Hubner (Lepidoptera: Pyralidae). Environmental Entomology. 34:676-682.
- Qader F., Mohammed B., Ameen H.2021. Efficacy of entomopathogenic nematodes against three species of stored product insects.IOP Conf. Series: Earth and Environmental Science 910.012047. IOP Publishing. DOI:10.1088/1755-1315/910/1/012047.

- Ramakrishnan J., Salame L, Nasser A, Glazer I.,Ment D.2022. Survival and efficacy of entomopathogenic nematodes on exposed surfaces. Scientific Reports 12:4629. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-022-08605-2>
- Ramos-Rodriguez O., Campbell JF.,Ramaswamy SB. 2007. Efficacy of the entomopathogenic nematodes *Steinernemariobrave* against the stored product pests *Triboliumcastaneum* and *Plodiainterpunctella*. Biological Control.40:15-21.
- Ramos-Rodriguez O.,Campbell JF.,Ramaswamy SB.2006. Pathogenicity of three species of entomopathogenic nematodes to some major stored product insect pests.Journal of Stored Products Research.42:241-252.
- Rumbos CI., Athanassiou C.2017.The use of entomopathogenic nematodes in the control of stored-product insects.Journal of Pest Science. 90(1):DOI: 10.1007/s10340-016-0795-y.
- Scholler M.,Prozell S.,Al-Kirshi AG.,Reichmuth C.1997.Towards biological control as a major component of integrated pest management in stored product protection.Journal of Stored Product Research.33(1):81-97.
- SvendsenTS.,Steenberg T. 2000. The potential use of entomopathogenic nematodes against *Typhaeastercorea*.Biocontrol. 45: 97-111.
- Tradan S.,Vidric M.,Valic N.2006. Activity of four entomopathogenic nematodes against young adult of *Sitophilusgranariorus* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) and *Oryzophilussurinamensis* (Coleoptera: Silvanidae) under laboratory condition. Plant Disease and Protection.113:168-173.
- Yuksel E., Canhilal R., Imren M.2019. Potential of four Turkish isolates of entomopathogenic nematodes against three major stored products insect pests. Journal of stored Products Research . 83:317-321.

