Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	**International Journal of Environment and Climate Change**
Manuscript Number:	**Ms_IJECC_90503**
Title of the Manuscript:	**Effect of nutrient and spacing on growth and biomass production in poplar under nursery condition**
Type of the Article	**Research**

General guideline for Peer Review process:
This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty'**, provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.
To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:
(https://www.journalijecc.com/index.php/IJECC/editorial-policy)
PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments	• **The effect of fertilizer is missing in the abstract** • **"However, detail of appropriate nutrient combinations and specific amounts varies according to soil types and clones' responses to fertilization are not known" as given by author in the abstract – yet he/she must analyse the soil and identify the type of clone for basal conclusion.** • **Not just table, graphical interpretation is necessary as in "**Eisenbies, M.H., Volk, T.A., Espinoza, J., Gantz, C., Himes, A., Posselius, J., Shuren, R., Stanton, B. and Summers, B., 2017. Biomass, spacing and planting design influence cut-and-chip harvesting in hybrid poplar. *Biomass and Bioenergy*, *106*, pp.182-190." • **In materials and methods: The representative samples - mention sample size or dimension, BGB -give expansion**	
Minor REVISION comments	• **The nursery condition during 2019 and 2020 maybe elaborated a bit. Although the condition changes with respect to year in each place and data can be collected using simple tools available at https://www.timeanddate.com/weather/india/hisar/climate** • **In Data collection for Phospotica and Azotica – if possible mention the composition of the biofertilizer or its source.** • **Some optimization tools can be used for the study to develop a model equation for the population** • **The main use of the tree is in plywood and hence stem roundness may also be a parameter as in "**Tun, T.N., Guo, J., Fang, S. and Tian, Y., 2018. Planting spacing affects canopy structure, biomass production and stem roundness in poplar plantations. *Scandinavian Journal of Forest Research*, *33*(5), pp.464-474." • **Also refer papers like "**Zhang, Y., Tian, Y., Ding, S., Lv, Y., Samjhana, W. and Fang, S., 2020. Growth, carbon storage, and optimal rotation in poplar plantations: A case study on clone and planting spacing effects. *Forests*, *11*(8), p.842."	
Optional/General comments	Nil	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	*(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)*	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	**Mothil Sengottian**
Department, University & Country	**Kongu Engineering College, India**